



**MALAYSIA**

## **LAPORAN PROSIDING**

### **MESYUARAT JAWATANKUASA KIRA-KIRA WANG NEGARA (PAC)**

Mengenai:

**Projek Sistem Kutipan Caj Jalan (RC) dan  
Rekod Kemasukan Kenderaan Asing (VEP)**

#### **Kementerian Pengangkutan:**

- (i) YBhg Datuk Mohd Khairul Adib bin Abd Rahman, Ketua Setiausaha

#### **TC Sens Sdn. Bhd.**

- (i) YBhg Tuan Tan Chean Suan, Ketua Pegawai Eksekutif
- (ii) YBhg Dato' Roslan Ramli, Pengerusi
- (iii) YBhg Dato' Mizal bin Zaini, Ahli Lembaga PEngarah

**PARLIMEN KEEMPAT BELAS  
PENGAL KEDUA**

---

MESYUARAT JAWATANKUASA KIRA-KIRA WANG NEGARA  
BILIK MESYUARAT JAWATANKUASA 1, TINGKAT 2 BLOK UTAMA  
BANGUNAN PARLIMEN, PARLIMEN MALAYSIA  
RABU, 23 OKTOBER 2019

---

**AHLI-AHLI JAWATANKUASA**

**Hadir**

YB. Dato' Dr. Noraini Ahmad - *Pengerusi*  
YB. Tuan Wong Kah Woh [Ipoh Timur] - *Timbalan Pengerusi*  
YB. Tuan Wong Chen [Subang]  
YB. Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar [Permatang Pauh]  
YB. Tuan Wong Hon Wai [Bukit Bendera]  
YB. Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon [Tebrau]  
YB. Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan [Kota Bharu]  
YB. Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah [Jasin]  
YB. Puan Wong Shu Qi [Kluang]  
YB. Tuan Haji Akmal Nasrullah bin Mohd Nasir [Johor Bahru]

**Tidak Hadir [Dengan Maaf]**

YB. Datuk Haji Hasanuddin bin Mohd Yunus [Hulu Langat]  
YB. Tuan Muslimin bin Yahaya [Sungai Besar]  
YB. Tuan Robert Lawson Chuat [Betong]  
YB. Dato' Sri Dr. Haji Ismail bin Haji Mohamed Said [Kuala Krau]  
YBhg. Datuk Roosme binti Hamzah - *Setiausaha*

**URUS SETIA**

Encik Ahmad Johan bin Mohd Affandi [Ketua Sekretariat Jawatankuasa Kira-kira Wang Negara, Parlimen Malaysia]  
Puan Siti Noor Akmar binti Zulkafli [Juruaudit Jawatankuasa Kira-kira Wang Negara, Parlimen Malaysia]  
Encik Rosli bin Aw Ahmad [Juruaudit Jawatankuasa Kira-kira Wang Negara, Parlimen Malaysia]  
Cik Siti Hajar binti Mohd Taib [Jurubahasa Serentak, Bahagian Pengurusan Dewan Rakyat, Parlimen Malaysia]

*samb/-*

---

**HADIR BERSAMA****Jabatan Audit Negara**

Encik Mohamed Ziadi bin Zakaria [Pengarah Bahagian Susulan Audit, Sektor Audit Prestasi]  
Encik Mohd Marzuni bin Muhamad [Pengarah Audit Prestasi, Bahagian III, Sektor Audit Prestasi]  
Cik Maszura Binti Hassan [Timbalan Pengarah Audit, Bahagian III, Sektor Audit Prestasi]  
Puan Nik Norwati bte Nik Harun [Penolong Pengarah Bahagian III, Sektor Audit Prestasi]

**Kementerian Kewangan**

Puan Azreen binti Awang [Ketua Penolong Setiausaha (Kawalan Pemantauan) 1]  
Encik Mohammad Adam Danial bin Hafiz Goh [Penolong Setiausaha (Kawalan Pemantauan) 2]

**Jabatan Peguam Negara**

Puan Rabiatul Adauwiyah binti Hamza [Peguam Kanan Persekutuan]  
Puan Nawal Nadia binti Azimuddin [Peguam Persekutuan]

**Suruhanjaya Pencegahan Rasuah Malaysia**

Dato' Shamsun Baharin bin Mohd Jamil [Timbalan Ketua Pesuruhjaya Pencegahan Ketua  
Pegawai Maklumat (CIO)]  
Encik Mohd Shah Azlan bin Mohd Hisam [Penguasa Kanan (Pemeriksaan dan Perundingan)]

**Kementerian Hal Ehwal Ekonomi**

Dato' Saiful Anuar bin Lebai Hussen [Ketua Setiausaha]  
Encik Azhar Bin Noraini [Pengarah Bahagian Infrastruktur dan Kemudahan Awam]

**Jabatan Perkhidmatan Awam**

Puan Noor Aini binti Ahmad [Timbalan Pengarah Kanan (Perkhidmatan)]

**Jabatan Akauntan Negara**

Encik Rusdi bin Ahmad@Ali [Ketua Penolong Pengarah Kanan (Bahagian Perkhidmatan Operasi  
Pusat dan Operasi)]

**SAKSI-SAKSI****Kementerian Pengangkutan Malaysia**

Tuan Syed Nasir Syed Ahmad [Timbalan Ketua Setiausaha (Dasar)]  
Encik Mohd Kamal Hisham Abu Bakar [Ketua Penolong Setiausaha, Bahagian Logistik dan  
Pengangkutan Darat]  
Encik Megat Farizul Ikhwan Megat Khushari [Penolong Setiausaha, Bahagian Logistik dan  
Pengangkutan Darat]  
Encik Nor Azam Abdul Rahman [Penolong Setiausaha, Bahagian Logistik dan Pengangkutan  
Darat]

**TCSens Sdn Bhd**

Encik Tan Chean Suan [Ketua Pegawai Eksekutif]

---

**LAPORAN PROSIDING**

**MESYUARAT JAWATANKUASA KIRA-KIRA WANG NEGARA  
PARLIMEN KEEMPAT BELAS, PENGGAL KEDUA**

**Rabu, 23 Oktober 2019**

**Bilik Jawatankuasa 1, Blok Utama, Parlimen Malaysia, Kuala Lumpur**

**Mesyuarat dimulakan pada pukul 2.42 petang**

*[Yang Berhormat Dato' Dr. Noraini Ahmad **mempengerusikan Mesyuarat**]*

---

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Bismillahi Rahmanir Rahim. Assalamualaikum warahmatullahi wabarakatuh.* Selamat petang, selamat sejahtera kepada Naib PAC Parlimen Yang Berhormat daripada Ipoh Timur, semua Yang Berhormat Ahli-ahli PAC Parlimen. Selamat datang kita ucapkan kepada ex officio daripada – kita berbesar hati hari ini kerana KSU Kementerian Hal Ehwal Ekonomi dapat bersama-sama dengan kita, terima kasih Dato'. Lepas itu, kita ada juga pegawai daripada MoF, daripada JPA, Jabatan Audit Negara, Jabatan Peguam Negara, SPRM dan Jabatan Akauntan Negara. Terima kasih semua kerana hadir pada hari ini.

Yang Berhormat Ahli-ahli Mesyuarat sekalian, petang ini PAC Parlimen meneruskan prosiding yang bertajuk Projek Sistem Kutipan Caj Jalan dan Rekod Kemasukan Kenderaan Asing di bawah Kementerian Pengangkutan yang dilaporkan dalam Laporan Ketua Audit Negara Tahun 2017 Siri 2.

Untuk makluman semua, ini adalah prosiding yang kelima membabitkan isu ini sejak jawatankuasa ini memulakan prosidingnya pada 20 Februari 2019. Untuk *recap*, bila kita mula menjalankan prosiding ini, Pengerusi ketika itu adalah Yang Berhormat Datuk Sri Dr. Ronald Kiandee dan Jawatankuasa PAC telah memanggil Yang Berbahagia Datuk Mohd Khairul Adib Abd Rahman. Ketika itu beliau adalah Ketua Setiausaha MOT tetapi kini telah dinaikkan pangkat sebagai Ketua Pengarah Perkhidmatan Awam.

*Then*, pada 27 Mac pula, jawatankuasa ini telah mendengar penjelasan dan keterangan daripada mantan Menteri Pengangkutan, Yang Berbahagia Dato' Sri Liow Tiong Lai, dia ini menjadi Menteri Pengangkutan bermula tahun 2014 iaitu pada 25 Jun sehingga 9 Mei 2018, bermaksud sebelum PRU.

Seterusnya, pada 3 April 2019, Jawatankuasa PAC telah mendengar laporan dan penjelasan dan keterangan daripada Yang Berbahagia Tan Sri Dato' Sri Dr. Ismail Haji Bakar, Ketua Setiausaha Negara. Dia pernah memegang, berkhidmat sebagai KSU MOT bermula 18

November 2014 dan berakhir sebagai KSU ketika itu adalah 15 Disember 2015, maknanya lebih kurang setahun sebulan.

Kemudian, pada 3 September 2019 pula, mantan Ahli Parlimen Tanjung Piai, Datuk Seri Wee Jeck Seng pula memberikan keterangan berhubung pemilikan saham dalam syarikat vendor yang mendapat projek sistem RC/VEP daripada MOT iaitu beliau menjadi *shareholder* dalam syarikat yang dinamakan TCSens Sdn Bhd.

Jadi, kita telah mengambil masa lapan bulan untuk mengadakan prosiding ini dan memanglah harapan saya agar prosiding hari ini prosiding yang terakhir tetapi ini tidak menyekat kita kalau kita hendak – jika kurang berpuas hati, kita boleh panggil siapa yang kita fikirkan perlu lagi.

Jadinya kalau ini prosiding yang terakhir, maka selepas ini kita akan memuktamadkan laporan kita melalui mesyuarat *housekeeping*. Jadinya Yang Berhormat Ahli-ahli Mesyuarat sekalian, untuk mengingatkan semula, izinkan saya memberikan sedikit latar belakang mengenai projek ini yang bermula 27 Mac 2015. Selepas Kabinet ketika itu membenarkan MOT melalui JPJ melaksanakan kutipan RC serta mendaftar dan mengeluarkan *tag Radio Frequency Identification Device (RFID)* bagi sistem VEP untuk semua kenderaan pendaftaran asing yang memasuki negara ini.

Projek ini dilaksanakan oleh kontraktor yang dipilih secara rundingan terus dengan kos berjumlah RM149.45 juta, membabitkan dua kontrak berasingan. Pertamanya, kontrak itu adalah *Capital Expenditure Contract (CAPEX)* yang berjumlah RM45.15 juta dan *Operational Expenditure Contract (OPEX)* berjumlah RM104.30 juta.

Berdasarkan kontrak CAPEX tempoh kontrak adalah 17 bulan dua minggu berakhir 30 April 2017 termasuk 12 bulan tempoh jaminan. Manakala, berdasarkan kontrak OPEX, tempoh pelaksanaan adalah selama lima tahun bermula 1 Ogos 2019 hingga 21 Julai 2021.

Nanti akan hadir di hadapan kita, PAC Parlimen sebentar lagi adalah Yang Berbahagia Timbalan Ketua Setiausaha (Dasar) MOT, Yang Berbahagia Tuan Syed Nasir Syed Ahmad dan juga Encik Tan Chuan Sen, Ketua Pegawai Eksekutif ataupun CEO syarikat TCSens Sendirian Berhad.

Cumanya hari itu kita membuat keputusan bahawa, kita kena panggil semua *board of directors* dan *shareholders*. Kenapa seorang sahaja dipanggil, yang lain?

**Encik Ahmad Johan bin Mohd Affandi [Ketua Sekretariat Jawatankuasa Kira-kira Wang Negara, Parlimen Malaysia]:** MOT hantar satu nama sahaja, CEO sahaja. Mungkin boleh tanya MOT sekejap lagi. Kita hantar memang minta *board of directors* dan *shareholders* datang.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *It's because, kita by doing that it is only fair* sebab kita telah panggil seorang, kenapa *that particular person* sahaja kita panggil.

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan [Kota Bharu]:** Yang seorang itu *shareholder or the board of director?*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Shareholder*, yang akan datang ini dia *shareholder*.

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** Yang sudah panggil?

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Shareholder* sahaja.

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *Shareholder, not board member?*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Bukan *board* pun. Akan tetapi sebelum kita panggil saksi masuk, saya hendak tanyakan dengan *ex-officio* kalau ada maklumat-maklumat terkini mengenai perkara ini ataupun pandangan mengenai isu ini sebelum saya panggil saksi ke hadapan PAC. Ada apa-apa tak, maklum balas? Dipersilakan. *[Sistem pembesar suara dimatikan]* Panggil. Siapa nama artis itu?

■1450

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh [Ipoh Timur]:** Artis... *[Sistem pembesar suara dimatikan]*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *Chairman*, dia itu siapa itu? AC Mizal itu siapa?

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Shareholder...*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *Shareholder? Oh... [Sistem pembesar suara dimatikan]*

*[Saksi-saksi dari Kementerian Pengangkutan Malaysia dan TCSens Sdn. Bhd. mengambil tempat di hadapan Jawatankuasa]*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Terima kasih banyak saya ucapkan kepada Yang Berbahagia Tuan Syed Nasir Syed Ahmad selaku Timbalan Ketua Setiausaha (Dasar) MOT. Seperti biasa saya mengucapkan terima kasih di atas kehadiran Yang Berbahagia Tuan Syed Nasir serta barisan pegawai-pegawai daripada MOT di hadapan PAC Parlimen pada petang ini. Juga ada bersama dengan kita adalah Encik Tan Chuan Sen, *the CEO of* syarikat TCSens Sdn. Bhd. *Is that correct?*

Untuk pengetahuan saksi yang hadir, Projek Sistem Kutipan Caj Jalan dan juga Rekod Kemasukan Kenderaan Asing di bawah MOT yang dilaporkan ini sebenarnya dilaporkan di bawah LKAN Tahun 2018 Siri 2. Kita telah memulakan prosiding ini beberapa kali dan ini adalah kali yang kelima sejak PAC Parlimen memulakan prosiding pada 20 Februari awal tahun ini maksudnya.

Jadinya tanpa membuang masa, saya hendak menjemput Yang Berbahagia Tuan Syed Nasir untuk memulakan keterangan dan penjelasan mengenai isu ini. Untuk *benefit* Encik Tan,

apa juga *presentation* dibuat, kadang-kadang ada *interjection* dan apa, *that one is normal because* Ahli-ahli PAC sekiranya dia mahukan lebih penjelasan, dia akan bertanya. Diharap dapatlah juga diberikan makluman kepada kita apa-apa jua pertanyaan yang diutarakan oleh Ahli-ahli PAC, ya. *Thank you.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** Tuan Pengerusi, minta laluan sedikit?

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Ya.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** Cuma sebelum Tuan Syed Nasir mulakan, saya hendak *check* dengan Encik Tan Chuan Sen. Dengan SSM *search* ini, seorang nama Tan Chean Suan itu bukan Encik Tan Chuan Sen kan? Ini sebab nama agak-agak sama.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan [Ketua Pegawai Eksekutif, TCSens Sdn Bhd]:** Tidak, itu yang nama saya, Tan Chean Suan. Bukan Tan Chuan Sen. Sebenarnya nama saya Tan Chean Suan.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** Oh, maaf. So, T-A-N C-H-E-A-N S-U-A-N.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** C-H-E-A-N S-U-A-N.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** So, *passport— IC number, 841113-14-6417?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Betul.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** So, *that is a correct person?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Yes, *correct person.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** So, nama di sana silap.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Yang nama ini semua apa itu?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Oh, okey.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Okey.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Sudah salah. C.H.E.A.N.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** So, *it is the same person-lah?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *It is the same person.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** Okay, *very well.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Maknanya orang yang sama. Cuma, macam mana boleh datang nama Encik Tan Chuan Sen itu?

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** Sekretariat?

**Encik Ahmad Johan bin Mohd Affandi:** Tuan Pengerusi.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Ya, saya.

**Encik Ahmad Johan bin Mohd Affandi:** Nama itu kita dapat daripada *list* yang MOT hantar.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** MOT ini. Macam mana ini? Sebab ini— itulah saya pun— sebab itu saya menggunakan nama Encik Tan sebagai Tan Chuan Sen. *You* pun diam saja.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Sudah *sign* dekat kehadiran sudah betul, yang sini salah saja.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Okay.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Di dalam ini salahlah.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *List* depan dah betul.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *List* betul dah.

**Encik Mohd Kamal Hisham Abu Bakar [Ketua Penolong Setiausaha, Bahagian Logistik dan Pengangkutan Darat, Kementerian Pengangkutan Malaysia]:** Bila kita hantar itu betul. Mungkin kadang-kadang komputer ada virus, ia lari. *[Ketawa]*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Amboi, salahkan komputer pula. *[Ketawa]*

**Encik Mohd Kamal Hisham Abu Bakar:** Minta maaf, *sorry.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Okay, thank you.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Okey. Kalau sekiranya perlu apa-apa maklumat yang mana— tetapi ini yang datang cuma berlima sajalah? Berlima semua pun ada nama di hadapan masing-masing. So, okeylah. Boleh mulakan Tuan Syed Nasir.

**Tuan Syed Nasir bin Syed Ahmad [Timbalan Ketua Setiausaha (Dasar), Kementerian Pengangkutan Malaysia]:** Terima kasih...

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Sebelum itu, saya hendak tanya. Kenapa seorang saja yang datang ini? Sedangkan dalam *shareholders* dan *members* ini, ia ada Encik Mizal bin Zaini, ia ada Encik Roslan bin Ramli.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Untuk jawab soalan Tuan Pengerusi...

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Bukan Tuan Pengerusi, Puan.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Sorry*, Puan Pengerusi. Puan Pengerusi, yang Encik Mizal, dia sebenarnya dia sudah tidak ada jadi *shareholder*— eh, bukan *shareholder*. *Director* syarikat. Dia sudah berhenti sejak tahun 2016.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Akan tetapi nama dia tidak hadir *meeting*? Ini sebab dia masih *shareholder* lagi kah?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Ini disebabkan dalam itu dia minta *director* untuk datang. Sebenarnya, dia *no longer a director*.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *So, who's the director of the company now?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Director— I'm the director of the company.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Okay, one and another one?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *The other one is Puan Law Poey Lyk.*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** Puan Law Poey Lyk? Chiam Lee Mun?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Sorry?*



Tuan Wong Kah Woh: Sekejap ya.

Tuan Pengerusi: Sekejap. Ini sebab kita— yang Chiam Lee Mun itu siapa? *Secretary company?*

Encik Tan Chean Suan: *It's a secretary company.*

Tuan Pengerusi: Okey.

Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan: Encik Zulkeflee ini sudah *resigned?*

Tuan Pengerusi: Encik Zulkeflee bin Hassan.

Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan: Encik Zulkeflee bin Hassan.

Encik Tan Chean Suan: Sudah *resigned*.

Tuan Pengerusi: Akan tetapi ini *updated* yang diberikan kepada kami.

Encik Tan Chean Suan: *So, now director there are two. One is me and the other one is*

Puan Law Poey Lyk.

Tuan Pengerusi: Puan Law Poey Lyk itu siapa? Itu...

Encik Tan Chean Suan: *That's my wife.*

Tuan Pengerusi: *Okay.*

Tuan Wong Kah Woh: Puan Law Poey Lyk, dia *date of appointment*, 8 Julai 2017?

Encik Tan Chean Suan: *Yes.*

Tuan Wong Kah Woh: Encik Zulkeflee bin Hassan pun November 2017?

Encik Tan Chean Suan: *Ya.*

Tuan Wong Kah Woh: Akan tetapi sekarang sudah tidak jadi *director* sudah?

Encik Tan Chean Suan: *Director*, ya.

Tuan Wong Kah Woh: Siapa yang satu orang *director* lagi? Encik Tan?

Encik Tan Chean Suan: *Yes.*

Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan: *Since when?*

Encik Tan Chean Suan: *Sorry?*

Tuan Wong Kah Woh: *Since when?*

Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan: *Since when appointment? Appointed when?*

Tuan Wong Kah Woh: *Your appointment?*

Encik Tan Chean Suan: *This year but which month I have to refer back but since year*

2019.

Tuan Wong Kah Woh: *Year 2019-lah?*

Encik Tan Chean Suan: *Ya.*

Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan: *To SSM buat the appointment but it's not here?*

Tuan Pengerusi: *Because it's not because...*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *Not stated ya?*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *The document that we received, I would assume is the latest one. You know what is shown right here? This is because it says here as directors and officers. They are, the first one is Encik Zulkeflee bin Hassan tetapi you mentioned dia sudah resigned. Resigned tahun ini kan?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Then yang second one will be Puan Law Poey Lyk, ya?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *The third one is Chiam Lee Mun. Chiam Lee Mun is the company secretary but your name is not here yet but if kalau ada yang baharu, kena furnish kita yang baharu jugalah.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon [Tebrau]:** *Tuan Pengerusi, Tuan Pengerusi. Ia ada di muka surat 4... [Merujuk kepada dokumen] Dia sudah resigned pada Julai 2017, Encik Tan Chean Suan. Dia sudah resigned ini. Dia bukan pengarah yang terkini.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Akan tetapi sudah menjadi...*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Kembali...*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Akan tetapi telah dilantik semula tahun 2019.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Akan tetapi dia kena tunjuklah dia punya pelantikan. Kalau tidak, kita cakap dengan seorang yang tidak ada kaitan dengan syarikat. Dia kena buktikan dia adalah pengarah syarikat itu.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Tuan Pengerusi, sebelum ini saya pernah buat satu carian berkenaan dengan maklumat pengarah untuk syarikat TCSens Sdn. Bhd. Carian saya buat pada 10 September 2019 yang mana dalam carian tersebut maklumat yang dinyatakan masih Puan Law Poey Lyk dengan Encik Zulkeflee bin Hassan. So, soalan daripada Yang Berhormat Subang tadi adalah whether have you— I mean dari Kota Bharu. Whether have you lodged the change of the director with SSM?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes, I think we did receive back the document from SSM being changed-lah.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Memang...*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *Did you bring along the latest document with you?*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Do you have it with you? This is because we need to have it with us to ensure that, first, orang yang kita— yang berada di dalam ini adalah orang yang sama dalam board of directors ataupun shareholder tetapi dalam board ini pun tidak ada nama dia. Senarai*

yang terkini yang kita terima ini adalah masih lagi Zulkeflee Hassan. Dia punya *date of appointment* pun sama lebih kurang tarikh dia dengan *your wife*.

■1500

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** Tuan Pengerusi, untuk mengesahkan, saya tahulah SSM kemungkinan dia ambil masa dua bulan atau tiga bulan untuk *update* dia punya sistem. Akan tetapi biasa punya sebagai akauntan, kita hendak terkini punya, kita minta dia punya setiausaha untuk mengesahkan siapa adalah pengarah atau *shareholders* yang terkini.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Betul. Yang Berhormat Tebrau kalau sekiranya tidak dapat di-*furnish*-kan itu, saya rasa I kena *call off this proceeding* dan kena datang lagi sekali.

**Tuan Haji Akmal Nasrullah bin Mohd Nasir [Johor Bahru]:** Cuma Tuan Pengerusi, kalau kita lihat di sini, beliau juga merupakan CEO. Jadi *on that basis* pun sebenarnya dia ada tanggungjawab dia selaku Ketua Pengarah Eksekutif *which is am I right or not? I mean you are the CEO of that company*.

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *But then* kita kena – *this case* – apalah dapat pengesahan dari *board of directors*. Kalau *board of directors* tidak sahkan dia adalah CEO, kita pun tidak boleh terima.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** Sekarang perbincangan... [Disampuk]

**Tuan Wong Chen [Subang]:** *Chairman*, senanglah macam ini, Encik Kenneth Tan. *Maybe you tell us what is your current role now, irrespective of the filing, what is your current role now? Are you a shareholder, director or management?*

**Encik Tan Chuan Sen:** Okey, *in term of shareholders, yes, I am the shareholder of the company that...* [Disampuk]

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Yes, one minute. Sorry.*

[Ahli-ahli berbincang sesama sendiri tanpa menggunakan pembesar suara]

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah [Jasin]:** *What I want to ask you, Tuan Pengerusi, this company is after your name you know. This company is after your name. That means you set up the company, you incorporate the company.*

**Encik Tan Chuan Sen:** *Yes.*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *That means this is your company.*

**Seorang Ahli:** *He is the founder.*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *You are the founder lah.*

**Encik Tan Chuan Sen:** *I am the founder of the company.*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *Founder, founder. Not 'funder'.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Sorry.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** Ya, ya. *Please, please. Explain yourself. What is your current role?*

**Encik Tan Chuan Sen:** *Okay, I am the shareholder of the company. I have been appointed back as the director of the company and also the CEO of the company.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *So, you are fully active now, right? So, you are before us as a director, irrespective of the filing status. To you, you are still the director. Do we need to check whether he is the director? Is there any dispute here? We do not have to lah?*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *I think he is the shareholder. It should be fine.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Sebab you juga adalah shareholder. Itu memang ada dalam dokumen. Just that tadi masa dalam prosiding menyatakan you adalah director tetapi dalam kita punya filing kita tidak menunjukkan the director. Dia tidak boleh – kita kena cakap benar ya.*

**Encik Tan Chuan Sen:** *Okey.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Kita kena cakap benar sebab itu salah satu daripada prosiding yang perlu diakui dalam mana-mana prosiding juga. Sebab itulah tadi when you said you adalah director sedangkan carian kita menunjukkan you bukan director tetapi you shareholder dan juga CEO. Jadinya saya harap nanti, dokumen terbaru itu boleh melalui sekretariat, boleh beri kepada sekretariat tetapi untuk sekarang, kita beranggapan ialah Encik Tan berada di sini atas kapasiti sebagai CEO dan juga shareholder.*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *Not only that Chairman, document shows that Mr. Tan was the director and had resigned on the 9th of July 2017 and then reappointed. But the reappointed one, there is no record here.*

*[Ahli-ahli berbincang sesama sendiri tanpa menggunakan pembesar suara]*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *IDF Global ini?*

**Encik Tan Chuan Sen:** *IDF Global also belongs to me.*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *Belongs to you?*

**Encik Tan Chuan Sen:** *Yes.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Siapa lagi dalam itu?*

**Encik Tan Chuan Sen:** *Also my wife.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *My wife. Eh, my wife pula, your wife. Sorry [Ketawa]*

**Encik Tan Chuan Sen:** *I mean Miss Law Poey Lyk.*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *I didn't know you are controlling the company. You are controlling the company.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Okey, okey tidak apa.*

**Rabiatul Adauwiyah binti Hamza [Peguam Kanan Persekutuan]:** *Tuan Pengerusi, I am from AGC, I actually did the research one today actually from our sharing punya platform lah*

dengan SSM *and I can verify that he is the director of the company, appointed on the 18th of September. I have the document here.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Terima kasih.

**Rabiatul Adauwiyah binti Hamza:** Ya, tetapi carian saya itu tidak ada lah *as detailed* SSM yang kita ada ini. *This one is actually a month old* punya carian ini. *Mine is actually today.* So dia sudah *update* dah. *I can verify that.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Okay, thank you very much.* Maka kita bolehlah. Tuan Syed lah. Tuan Syed juga.

**Tuan Syed Nasir Syed Ahmad:** *Assalamualaikum warahmatullahi wabarakatuh.* Tuan Pengerusi, Yang Berhormat Timbalan Pengerusi, Dato' Seri, tuan-tuan dan puan-puan semua. Status semasa ya projek RC dan VEP ini. Untuk Projek Sistem Kutipan Caj Jalan ataupun RC dan Rekod Kemasukan Kenderaan Asing (VEP) merupakan satu projek yang dibangunkan di sempadan Malaysia-Singapura. Projek ini...

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Tuan Syed, ini baca sahajalah ini? Tidak ada slaid, tidak ada apa ini?

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar [Permatang Pauh] :** Ada. Dalam rekod, rujuk lama punya.

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar :** *I don't know, I have it here.*

**Encik Mohd Kamal Hisham Abu Bakar:** Minta maaf Tuan Pengerusi. Kita tidak dimaklumkan – kita dalam jemputan kali ini – *Sorry*, kita bukan hendak *blame* urus setia or *anything* tetapi *we were not informed to prepare a presentation. We were informed to come here to – as a witness* kepada soalan yang mungkin PAC ada kepada pihak syarikat *and actually* Tuan Pengerusi *I think* yang kita punya *presentation actually the same* yang kita sudah bentang *for the past, for PAC* itu sama.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *[Bercakap tanpa menggunakan pembesar suara]*

**Encik Mohd Kamal Hisham Abu Bakar:** Ya, sama Tuan Pengerusi.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Kalau sekiranya sama *exactly* sama kah atau tidak ini Tuan Syed?

**Tuan Syed Nasir Syed Ahmad:** *Does not change.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Kalau sama, sudah telah diterangkan dalam PAC. Buat apa hendak terangkan lagi kalau sudah macam itu.

**Encik Mohd Kamal Hisham Abu Bakar:** Itulah yang dimaklumkan. Kita dijemput untuk *to be supporting actor* dalam sesi kali ini.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Amboi. Okey, okey lah silakan.

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** Tuan Pengerusi, boleh saya tanya soalan? Memandangkan kita sudah ada kehadiran TKSU di sini, kalau kita rujuk pada pembentangan pada bulan Februari 2019 oleh MOT, disertakan syor-syor oleh pihak audit selepas mereka

menemui beberapa penemuan yang bermasalah, yang harus diselesaikan. Mungkin – sedangkan projek ini antara projek yang paling utama, paling besar di bawah kementerian.

Mungkin kalau TKSU, Tuan Syed boleh berikan sedikit maklum balas terkini kerana selalunya bila kita temui wakil kementerian, mereka boleh memperincikan *the latest update* sehingga setakat ini. Tidaklah perlu terperinci tetapi memandangkan kalau ada supaya kita sekurang-kurangnya PAC mendapat maklum balas, *there has been some progress*. Ini kerana kalau kita tengok *timeline* nya daripada tahun 2015 sampailah sekarang, kerajaan dibelenggu dengan projek yang tidak terlaksana sepenuhnya. Jadi kalau ada, saya mohon diberikan maklum balas.

**Tuan Syed Nasir Syed Ahmad:** Terima kasih Yang Berhormat. Sehingga terkini untuk projek RC dan VEP ini, untuk RC, sudah mula berjalan bermula pada November 2016 dan bermula sehingga kini *collection* oleh JPJ untuk RC adalah RM319,099,640. Dalam tempoh ini, kutipannya adalah sebanyak RM20 *for* setiap kemasukan dan daripada situ, RM5 diserahkan kepada Kerajaan Negeri Johor. Untuk terkini ...

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** Sebanyak RM5?

**Tuan Syed Nasir Syed Ahmad:** Kepada *state of Johor*. So RM15 kepada JPJ. RC telah berjalan seperti biasa. Hanya VEP ini kita telah mula bergerak tetapi isunya ialah kita ada *counter about this* kenderaan ini, mereka suka datang *at the last minute*. So kita punya *target was about few hundred thousand*. Sehingga kini, kita ada lebih kurang hanya 40,000 sahaja kenderaan yang ada *RFID tag* ini. Jadi, bila sekarang ini kita sudah ada empat *fitment centre* dan kita akan buka *a few more* lagi untuk *expedite the target to get at least 100,000 vehicles* dengan *RFID tag* ini *by March 2020*.

#### ■1510

Macam biasalah bila *last minute* ini semua berebut. Jadi, masanya panjang kita bagi, tetapi dia tunggu *last minute* baru dia datang, status terkini.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Saya juga mendapat makluman bahawa ada dalam penemuan audit tersebut mengenai pentadbiran kontrak, berlaku pertindihan skop kerja antara *corrective maintenance summary report* dengan *service level agreement report* di mana jumlah kos SLA adalah berjumlah RM1.59 juta dan CMSR berjumlah RM20.82 juta. Jadinya dalam AG punya apa ini...

**Encik Ahmad Johan bin Mohd Affandi:** *AG Dashboard*.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Dashboard*, Jabatan Audit punya *dashboard* ini yang lainnya telah diambil tindakan oleh pihak kementerian kecuai yang ini. Apakah tindakan yang sekarang cuba dilaksanakan oleh kementerian mengenai penemuan audit yang ini dulu?

**Encik Mohd Kamal Hisham bin Abu Bakar:** Tuan Pengerusi, untuk makluman Tuan Pengerusi susulan kepada teguran audit tersebut, pihak kementerian telah mengadakan beberapa perbincangan bersama dengan pihak syarikat yang mana kita ambil tindakan pada teguran audit tersebut. Dalam perbincangan tersebut pihak audit— pihak syarikat telah bersetuju untuk tidak meneruskan ataupun menuntut *double counting* tersebut dan berdasarkan susulan nasihat PUU kita, kita sedang bangunkan dan *finalise*-kan *supplementary agreement* dengan pihak syarikat untuk keluarkan benda-benda tersebut daripada kontrak asal.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Okey, maknanya syarikat di mana syarikat TCSens yang mengatakan persetujuan tersebut.

Okey, berbalik kepada Encik Tan. Beberapa prosiding sebelum ini memang ada diperkatakan mengenai syarikat yang telah mendapat *award* ini— dapat *award*-lah, *the whole thing, the whole story is about all—the stories* nanti berbalik kepada TCSens. Cuma saya hendak bertanya dengan Encik Tan, mungkin yang lain belum lagi sebab baru lepas *lunch* ya. Jadinya, [Ketawa] bagaimana mula-mula Encik Tan mendapat projek daripada kerajaan ini? Mungkin boleh ceritakan semula.

**Encik Tan Chen Suan:** Pada mula-mula kita ikut balik yang prosedur yang *government*, kita *prepare*-kan *proposal* RFP kepada kerajaan...

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Adjust the mic.* Ya, *thanks.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Okey. So, mula-mula kita *prepare*-kan *proposal* RFP kepada kerajaan. So dari sana kerajaan panggil RFP saya ingat dalam lima atau enam syarikat datang untuk *provide*-kan RFP itu. Selepas RFP, *I think* kerajaan sudah *shortlisted* syarikat untuk buat POC. Dari POC— kita sudah sukses dari POC pertama. Lepas itu *few months later* kementerian pun suruh syarikat buat POC kedua. So, kita dah ikutkan apa prosedur yang kementerian suruh kita buat, kita ikut sahaja. Selepas itu bila dapat *award*, kita terus jalankan projek itu.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** Okey. *Do you have the exact date* yang mana *proposal* disediakan kali pertama oleh syarikat Encik Tan kepada kerajaan?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Yang *proposal* ada tetapi *I* kena *recall* balik itu *date*-lah. Saya tidak bawa dalam sini. So yang itu *date* memang ada saya ingat dari tahun 2013 atau tahun 2014. *I* kena *recall* balik.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** Tahun 2013 atau 2014.

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** Ataupun tahun 2014.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** Kena *recall*-lah. Okey. Akan tetapi *you* ada baca dari mana-mana kerajaan hendak melaksanakan projek inikah atau *that is on your own initiative that you put in the proposal*?

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** Okey, *this whole project actually is started*— kita baca balik dari tahun 2007. Dia ada satu projek sama lebih kurang dia panggil AVSS *something* projek sudah *installed* masa itu. Selepas itu *the project* tidak jalan sebab *Visit Malaysia Year 2007*. *So that project being on hold*. *From there actually we came out the ideas that a better technology instead of the old technology*.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Di kementerian siapa yang Encik Tan jumpa?

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** Tidak, dalam itu— itu projek memang *I...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Bukan, bukan. Maksudnya *when you want to come out with a proposal for the government, obviously you will meet someone from the ministry level*. Siapa itu?

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** Okey. *The first proposal we submitted that time is to JPJ*. *Sorry I need to recall back. Not in 2013. I remember the first proposal we submitted is in 2012 to JPJ*. *Then 2013 or 2014, we submitted to MOT*.

**Tuan Wong Chen:** Okey, saya ada soalan Encik Tan ya. Okey, *you said that the government had the RFP out, is it? The Request for Proposal*.

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** Ya, yes.

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Who prepared the RFP? Is it your company or did the government itself prepared the RFP and you went inside your tender process?*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *We came out the proposal, the RFP. We came out all the proposal, our technologies, what can be used for that project*.

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *So basically you wrote the RFP on behalf of the Malaysian Government*.

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *No, I think that one is not called RFP. It is a proposal-lah. We submitted all our proposals. I should say that is not RFP. I think that one is a proposal. We just came out all our proposals and our technicals to present what we have*.

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *So, did the government give you a document ya, with specific guideline what they want to achieve?*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *Oh, no*.

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *So how did they consider your project? How many other companies put in a tender? You said three or four, five companies, right?*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *Five to six companies*.



**Tuan Wong Chen:** *So, the government did not control the tender process. Is it? They just say buka, open completely. Anybody tenders anything they want.*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *No, there's the solution. How, what solution we use to do the collection. We are using— for our side we using ANPR RFID. Some other companies using different solutions.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *But basically the first document for this process, this entire tender, okay whether it is negotiated tender or open tender, that subjects to clarification from the ministry-lah. That process, did they say I want— how many thousand cars, you know. Did they say that the system has to be within this price range and then you come and tender?*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *No. There's no price range at that time and what technologies and numbers of car, did not.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *So, it is just empty-lah. You just say we have this idea, you all put it in your proposal? I mean it sounds like it-lah. [Ketawa] I mean there was no really guideline.*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *Because actually what we follow the guideline says follow the existing project that what we know in year 2007. So, that's what we tried to propose but the whole details— let me try to check it out because that one been like six, seven years...*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *No, I know. I understand.*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *I need some time to recall back.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *What I am saying is the first time you get an official document to you, you surely must have like I want this project with this kind of criteria or targets, right. Then you go there and you and your team work out the numbers and technology and then proposed back to them. It has to be like that, it cannot be like out of the blue, you go and submit something.*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *We actually, we just submitted slides. Also I think that time we submitted not only that, we submitted the other like approach to government for— to solve the solution at that time. We try to just prepare a proposal and we found out that the country facing this problem. So, we come out the proposal to try to...*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Ya, so basically there was no process of opening up tender to everybody. You had— you look at the system, you thought it's not a good idea. So you have a good idea, you go in and proposed to the government.*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *Okey.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *The initiative is yours-lah basically. It's not the government's initiative.*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *In 2012, there was what we started. We started to submit the proposal. Then in 2013 or 2014, they asked us. Let me recall back. They asked four or five companies come in to present.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Ya, I understand.*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *How that official been...*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *But the idea comes from your company, right?*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *In year 2012.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Ya, 2012 is your company. It's not the Minister who woke up one day, he had a dream that we must do something. Therefore he writes a policy out and all of you tender. This is your idea. You went to the Minister and then in 2012, you gave the idea. Then he opens up in 2014 some sort of tender-lah.*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *No, in 2012 we did not go to the ministry, we just submitted our proposal to JPJ only. In 2012.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Ya, but you submitted to the what? The Secretary General of JPJ or the Director of JPJ?*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *We just submitted to the— I think this is under— I think it should be under...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Ketua Pengarah.*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *No, I think that one...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Bawah kepada Ketua Pengarah kah apa?*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *...We submitted to Pelesenan probably because there something register. We were just submitted in only. Just...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *But you must have submitted it to someone you know, someone yang ada power. Sebab kalau submitted kepada penguat kuasa dekat bawah, apa dekat Batu Pahat kah, dekat mana, that one doesn't make any difference, you know.*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *Ya, I understand. Because I need to...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Siapa itu yang you— when you submitted the proposal, siapa itu yang terima proposal itu?*

**Encik Tuan Chean Suan:** *Yang terima proposal. Let me recall back sebab itu sudah tujuh tahun lepas, lapan tahun lepas. I can't remember the letters. Yes, I understand the letters issue...*

■1520

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Orang dia pun tidak ingat siapa? Tuan Syed Nasir-kah? Contoh. Contoh sahaja Tuan Syed.*

**Tuan Syed Nasir Syed Ahmad:** *You sent to Ketua Pengarah (KP) JPJ kah?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Itu, I kena recall balik Tuan Pengerusi. Ini sebab itu memang sudah lama. I kena cari balik surat itu, kita issue kepada siapa.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Let me ask this way, who was your core supporter? You have an idea – I have an idea, I can submit to Yang Berhormat Kota Bharu, right? If somebody is not there to carry this paper and say you know, “Mr. Tan, this is a fantastic idea. You are going to save money for the country. This is good”. There must be a core champion. Takkan you tidak remember who is your champion. Everybody must know.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *It is because we just – the idea – we actually we saw the - I would say the system – at one system that can help our government...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Itu betul Encik Tan...*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Okey. Ya, then just that... [Disampuk]*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Idea itu – sorry. Idea itu, you can have big ideas. But, orang yang akan melaksanakan dia itu mesti ada jawatan. Paling tidak pun Timbalan Ketua Pengarah. I mean someone very high for your proposal to be brought by the government and implemented by the government. That is the most important.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Through direct negotiation.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Ya.*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *Dia dua kemungkinan-lah. Satu, kepada any top officer from the ministry or through politics. Can you tell us which channel?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Definitely not politics because I did not involve any. I don't know about politics. I just have some ideas because I have been doing other businesses in trading. When I saw that instead of trading, this is something good, why not we just try to propose. But to whom, yes. To answer back the questions to whom, let me recall back the letters because it has been too many years.*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *But definitely to the branches, one of the branches in the MOT-lah?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No. In JPJ...*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *In MOT?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I still remember that one still in their old buildings, the old buildings of JPJ. But to whom, I have to check back.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *So, Ketua Pengarah – you know, letter is different. I can write a letter to the Prime Minister. But at the end of the day, it is not the Prime Minister yang akan panggil I. Maybe akan melalui dia punya Setiausaha Sulit Kanan, for example. You know, someone is very close to the Minister and angkat your proposal melalui perbincangan atau apa, angkat your proposal to the Minister or to the Deputy Minister or to the Prime Minister. Itu yang kita hendak tahu because nobody ataupun setakat yang kita tahulah, tidak akan ada apa-apa juga projek di*

dalam kerajaan ini boleh dibagi – *I mean*, dibagi just tulis surat and then, “wah, this is a great idea”. Then lepas itu, terus dia buat based on the letter. No. You must have met someone and who is that someone itu?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No. We did not meet what so-called what someone. Let me come back to the letters, who is that letters I had given to and addressed to, I need to check back. So, what we did is we prepared the proposal, then they called for a meeting. So, we came in the meeting to present our solutions and what we have.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *No. I think soalan di sini adalah you cannot be bringing your proposal, go to any of the JPJ counter and tell them, “Look, this is my proposal” and put there. So, the question from the bench here, I mean daripada committee adalah whom did you send the thing to, so that your matter can get the attention. I am very sure that you would not be able to get this done by handling the document to the counter. So, that is the key thing.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Mr. Kenneth, I just want to stress one point for you, so that you don’t feel like you are under pressure to answer. This proposal we think is okay, it is a good thing. If you can solve traffic problems, you can solve what it is, it is good. So, I am not implying there is some hanky-panky going on. But, there is no way in hell you can get a proposal like this through for serious consideration by the ministry unless there is somebody there to – who believe in this. That does not mean the guy is under your payroll or is your best friend or went to your wedding. This is just a person, a civil servant that thinks this is a good idea, I will champion this for Mr. Tan. You must remember who this person is.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Okay. What I just remember – the name I forgotten. I addressed who – I come back to the same but, I remember the process was we submitted the proposal, then they responded...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Submitted to who?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *That is why I said I need to check back the letters who I submitted to because...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *It means that the letter that you...*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Addressed to is the one I was going to submit...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *The address is the one who received your proposal then?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Exactly.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Okey.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *So, from there itself, they called us like – because when we sent the letters and they endorsed, so they called us to present. That was the process, the present...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *You said “they”, who is “they”?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I mean the JPJ, the committee. Not one of them, I think there is a few of them in the committee asked us to present what we want.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Okay guys, I think we should stop...*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *Ask follow-up.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Sorry, sorry. Yang Berhormat Permatang Pauh, can I just finish this line?*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *Okay, All right.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Let's just not beat around the bush anymore. This is straight to the point. Did you approach the Minister, Dato' Sri Liow Tiong Lai? I don't know whether he was a Minister back then. But, did you approach MCA to help you? Simple, yes or no?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I answer Yang Berhormat, on that question. I can say it is no because even I think into – first, you said about MCA, I don't involve anything in MCA. I didn't enter MCA building before. So, I am not – I don't know anybody in MCA and if you say about the Minister, that time I still don't know the old – that one still under JPJ time...*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Not a Minister yet?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *That one was a long time ago. That one...*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *I just want to ask follow-up, Tuan Pengerusi. Just now Mr. Tan, you mentioned that you had previous letters, correspondences and you will look for them. Boleh tidak Encik Tan berikan sesalinan surat permohonan awal kerana sekarang daripada jawapan yang disebut, ada nama yang mungkin Encik Tan tidak ingat sekarang, tetapi akan membantu tugas kami. Kalau ada surat asal daripada peringkat awal, pohon dengan siapa, Ketua Pengarah mana, jadi flow chart itu senang. Kalau boleh diberikan seberapa segera, bila?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I akan check back fail-fail itu sebab sudah tujuh ke lapan tahun. I akan check back itu fail dan I akan bagikan surat itu.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Tuan Pengerusi, boleh saya tanya satu soalan?*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Boleh, boleh Yang Berhormat Tebrau.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *You know Wee Jeck Seng?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes, as a like long time ago, I know him from a long time ago.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *He is a shareholder. He was a shareholder in this company?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *You said you don't know anybody in MCA.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Okay. I mean that – it is because I know him as a Deputy Minister, actually I really don't involve, I don't know he is from all this politics, I don't. I just know in the time, I know him...*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *Impossible. MCA has been in power and in MOT for so long.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No. I mean I know him as the Deputy Minister, I don't know about – at that time, I am still young, I don't know about politics. I just know him...*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Whether you know politics is irrelevant-lah. But, you are saying you don't know him. But, how come he can own RM1.25 million shares in this company that you formed? How come he paid for it?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Okay. Come back to that question, I know him at the time he was a Deputy Minister from 10 years ago. That time I met him, I know him about I think 10 years or 11 years ago...*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *When was it?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *In possible year 2009 or 2010.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *In 2009 or 2010 you started knowing him as a Deputy Minister?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes.*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *Mr.Tan, this company name TCSens Sdn. Bhd., incorporated in 9<sup>th</sup> of March 2012. Is this company name referring to your name, Tan Chean Suan?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes.*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *It is incorporated in 2012?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Year 2012.*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *After you get to know Dato' Sri Wee Jeck Seng, is it?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes. For this company, yes.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Before that Yang Berhormat Jasin, I think you still need to continue to answer Yang Berhormat Tebrau's question just now on Dato' Sri Wee Jeck Seng position. You know him in 2009 or 2010, when he was a Deputy Minister. Continue.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Okay. I know him when he was a Deputy Minister. The time about MCA or all this thing, I don't know how is the politics because I just know he was the Deputy Minister at that time. It is because I just – that time possible, my age quite young, so I don't know about – we don't involve any like politics. We don't know what is it...*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Okay, never mind. One more question. Since you don't know him, since you said acquaintance but...*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I said I don't know MCA. I did not say I don't know him. I don't know what MCA is.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Okay. Since you are saying that you know him as an acquaintance, I mean you don't know him well. Then, how could he ended up as a shareholder? Did you use him as a so-called cable to reach the Minister? Answer yes or no.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No ,sir.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *No?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Sebelum itu, saya cuma hendak maklumkan bahawa...*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *As a businessman, you always think two steps ahead...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Sekejap Yang Berhormat Jasin.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Yang Berhormat Jasin, Yang Berhormat Jasin, sekejap.*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *Sorry.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Sekejap, sekejap sahaja. [Ketawa]*

■1530

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Saya cuma hendak maklumkan bahawa Yang Berhormat Dato' Sri Liow Tiong Lai berkhidmat sebagai Menteri Pengangkutan bermula 25 Jun 2014 sehingga 9 Mei 2018 dan sebelum itu adalah Chan kot?*

**Seorang Ahli:** *Dato' Seri Hisham...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Oh, sebelum itu adalah Dato' Seri Hishammuddin, caretaker sebelum berubah kepada Dato' Sri Liow Tiong Lai. Okey, teruskan Yang Berhormat Jasin.*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *I can imagine as a businessman you are always two steps ahead. Just now, Yang Berhormat Subang was asking you a very simple question, very simple one. Was it your own initiative or you were being tip-off of this particular project?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Sorry, I can't...*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *Was it your initiative or you were being tip-off of this project coming out?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *The initiative for this project?*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *Yes.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *That was what we – initiative to propose the solution.*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *As a businessman, you are also having some limitation, you know. Then, you got to initiate something through someone. Who is actually now in the capacity?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *We did not go through so-called through someone. We just submitted, I would say. We just submitted the proposal like not in here. We did it in other country, the same things, the solution is good, sometime even they come to us. We have such technology, sometime they come to us. Not we go and approach like for in other countries. But in Malaysia itself, we did the so-called the proposal to submit our ideas.*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *I understand. Your proposal was really excellent, it's a good proposal for the betterment of the ministry or for correction purposes. But the thing is you need to get someone, who is actually in the position to secure something.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I think for us— for business we do not go in into so-called get someone. We always believe that it is a good proposal, it's a good some system, people will purchase it or own it...*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *No matter how good your proposal is, that is why I said, you have a limitation.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *That's why the whole thing or the whole— this award being done is we submitted the proposal. So what— we've been called— like we've been called for present, we present. We've been called to do— submit our proposal, we submit. We've been called for POC, we do the POC. Then, from one POC to second POC.*

*So, this is what all the time we did, what we have been called by the government, we come to— we just do it. We received a letter to ask us— email to ask us to do POC, we come and do the POC...*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *We deliberate on this, we have already checked your record. We have seen someone who is in the capacity being a shareholder and a big amount also, you know? And he is someone.*

*I am telling you just now you have got a limitation but you see, in this case he's holding a share, a big share in the company.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Okay, let me try a different line of questioning, Mr. Kenneth Tan. First thing, how old are you now?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I am 35.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *You are 35 years old. So, in the year 2012, you were only...*

**Seorang Ahli:** *28 years old.*



**Tuan Wong Chen:** *28 years old, okay. Let me ask what is your background? Do you have a degree in software engineering?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Okay, yes. I have a— not a degree but in diploma but then I have done in many business industries, I do in trading, I do in construction business, I do trading in overseas. In those days, I do have a restaurant. Then, I do have IT companies...*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *So, yeah, what do you trade in? Just give us your history because you are very young. At 28 you got hundred plus million-dollar project which is a IT project of some substance. So, I'm trying to understand, where is your IT training, normally— I am not saying that you know businessman can do anything, run restaurant and still get 160-million-dollar IT project is possible in this world. But where do you get the knowledge on information technology? Did you do some project with IBM before? Did you have— what is the history regarding this to lead you to get this project?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *To answer Yang Berhormat on this question. I do— actually RFID itself I do supply in trading, I do supply RFID tag in year 2008 or 2009 to Ministry of Home Affairs. But I just a subcontractor to provide the RFID tags for those genuine CDs labelling.*

*So, from there we turn to RFID. Then we do supply RFID readers to the UKM school. So, from there actually we started FRID because RFID at that time is a new technology business. So, from there actually, I do RFID.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *So, you buy— where did you buy this RFID from?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I bought from— those days I bought from LS, it is under LG Group, South Korea.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *South Korea. So, you buy and then you sell to the ministry, right?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I just a sub-con, so I got the orders, then I just sell to the companies.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *So, you are a trader. You are not really an installer of this programme, of these RFID tags?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I am the trader and I also know the technology how it works.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *No, I know. Everybody know how to – if I have to sell mango, I know how mango is grown, right. So, you buy RFID from South Korea. You sell the RFID but you don't install the RFID, right? You just a seller, a dealer, a supplier.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Actually RFID is a just piece of sticker.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *I know RFID is a piece of sticker but sometimes you have to install the system, the reader, everything. Sometimes when people buy— do a project as a subcontractor, they buy the thing, they install the thing. In your case, you just buy and sell, correct?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *It depends. Some projects I buy and sell, some projects we buy and install.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *That's right. So, please describe to me, how— what was the project? How much was the value? What experience do you have in installation of the RFID programme? The system.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Okay, in— for this Home Affairs, we supply that one was like— let me recall. Possibly the tag was like 15 million tags. That one was just a trading. So like UKM, I supply and install RFID readers, the value I forgotten but also hundreds of readers that time in UKM, install and— not only supply but also install.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Understand. So roughly how big was this project? Was it RM5 million, RM2 million, 1.5 million?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *That one, I think not like as big as this project but also I have to really check back because that one was like years ago, more than 10 years ago.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *No, I understand but this is your first RFID project. You remember this, like giving birth to your first child, you remember.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *The first project we did was that one that Home Affairs. That's why I always remember the big volume on it...*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *How much was the contract? Contract, the road— how much you bought from LG? How much you sell to the government? Of course, you can...*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I would highlight back, I do not sell directly to the government. I was just a sub-con to supply the tag. That tag was— the time was like USD400,000, around that.*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *I want to ask a follow-up related to...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Okey, kita bagi Yang Berhormat Permatang Pauh dulu.*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *Terima kasih Tuan Pengerusi. Related to what Yang Berhormat Subang mentioned. So, 2012 is the contract, you were supplying this RFID system to Ministry of Home Affairs.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Not 2012. That one way before.*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *Earlier, much earlier when you were younger, okay. So, my question is you should have been an expert by 2015, 2016 but I see that one of the key criticisms is the increase in operational cost by 199 percent from your initial proposal. So meaning, after all the experience with RFID, supplying it to Ministry of Home Affairs, supplying it to UKM, why couldn't you budget properly when you were presenting the implementation at MOT level? Was it because you were merely involved with procurement and do you have any ownership of the system itself?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I think come back to the...*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *Please explain.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *To increase the amount was the additional scope been asked. Like last time we just used to be supply, install and sell but the whole scope has been changed from there into supplying manpower. We have to supply like 100 manpower. That was not our plan.*

*This is because we used to design that we've supplied the system but the whole scope being changed to supply not only that, also the manpower.*

■1540

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *Sure. So, basically if I get it correct from what Yang Berhormat Subang was asking, your expertise is restricted to the procurement. Meaning at no point that TCSens actually own this software or RFID. Meaning you were still procuring from an initial ownership and the sort of the master coder-lah.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No, actually the whole system —this system I just recalled back, this system is a...*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *You recalled back?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Not recalled back. I meant that the whole system that is not on-shelf product. This is a customised 100 percent system. It's not like we can buy and we can sell it. So, this is a system that we designed and developed. So, it's not like so-called like any product.*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *Then, thank you. So, you customised, you designed and you developed. Now, my question then, what is your immediate response when by May this year, May 2019, they've started deploying the pilots of having the RFID system linkage with the e-wallet application..*

*Unfortunately, in the pilot, they've found that there was a flaw in the system leading to overcharging by some vehicles, slow detection and the boom barrier failure to sort of, you know, go up and down accordingly. What would be your main response considering that you are the one customising the system for the usage of Malaysian car owners?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Okay. The system actually is not that simple. There are too many integration points that— like for instance, the barrier does not belong to us. The barriers belong to the PLUS highway, different company. So, there's a lot of criteria like in that location, many cars that come – congested, they will try to – bumper to bumper. So, there's a lot of like driver's behaviour itself.*

*Then, also come back to a lot of things like at the borders, the barriers do not belong to even the kementerian. They belong to third— like Plus highway's owner. So, this is where the thing come from.*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *So, just my last question. Thank you, Tuan Pengerusi. Ideally, do you think that TCSens has the capability to resolve all this —integrating the separate programmes and making sure that by a particular year a deadline that the MOT has set that it will be problem-free?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Okay. For the past project, what on our scope we have done, we have actually delivered on our scope. The thing that has been delayed due to third-party integrations, that is beyond our control. For instance, the Customs. uCustoms side when it's not ready, there's not much we can do. The e-wallet actually does not belong to us. The e-wallet belongs to Touch 'n Go. So, when the other parties are not ready, it makes the whole system like there's one part is not ready.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Hello...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Okey, Yang Berhormat Tebrau.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Okey, terima kasih.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Selepas itu, baru...*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *I still follow on my question earlier on. You haven't answered. When did Wee Jeck Seng got his share in the company? Which year?*

*[Ahli-ahli berbincang sesama sendiri]*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *You mean you can't even remember? Such a big shareholder?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *There's a long way, many things I need to remember.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *That can't be-lah. A big shareholder, you cannot remember. When did he dispose his shares?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I do have, I...*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Buy and sell.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I do have the information that I think in year 2014.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Year 2014, he acquired the shares?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Year 2015 that you got the contract, isn't it?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Contract was on year 2015.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Yeah. So, you allowed him to take up shares in the company a year before you got the contract. You said he played no part in linking you to the Minister of Transport?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Then, what was the point of giving him the shares?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I gave him the shares – actually, this project has been ongoing on for years. So, we also don't want to involve any so-called politics into business. So, we get him in actually is not for this. We were trying to get – ask him to introduce us to the Belt and Road business. This is because that time, Belt and Road is very famous then. We were trying to have more business in overseas.*

*So, we just asked to introduce us only. Not to —but when he came in, he just came in as a sleeping partner or sleeping shareholder.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Just now, you just said, you actually invited him to join this company for the One Belt One Road Initiative. That means you are trying to use his influence-lah to get businesses. You've just confirmed that.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No, I would not agree. I.. [Bercakap tanpa menggunakan pembesar suara]*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *No, no. I'm not, I'm not. One Belt One Road. Actually, you just said, isn't it? You were saying he...*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No. I mean yes, just like a friend. Like I have a friend. My friend does a business. Then, the other friend does their – because we just have the friend to introduce. That's it only. Actually we don't really use so-called him to do any business. Just that he has friends, just try to introduce.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Then, do you agree that you don't even have to invite him to be the shareholder in that case?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes but what we are trying to do that at least he feels like he has a share. So, he will always remind the company if there is a friend, he just introduce.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Ya lah.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *So, you are —that means...*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Both of you have an interest. So...*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No. I will say not in so-called interest. Just a friend to...*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *No, I don't believe. If I'm your friend, you ask me to put in RM1.2 million, no way I will put RM1.2 million. Unless I am getting something out of it. Will you, will you put into my company? I got a company. Now, I don't have any project. Will you put in RM1.2 million in my company?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *If the company having good business, we will...*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *At the moment don't have what? TCSens, at that time, don't have any contract.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No, we've actually —for us, we asked our personnel. I do invest that company to have potential. Not only...*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *What potential you've got? Just now I think Yang Berhormat Subang asked you that you don't even have a prior experience in the what we call I think software. Your background, you said you only have a diploma, you have no software engineering what we call experience, so what potential has this company got? I don't see any potential.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Our potential is the RFID. I've told you that we have such good technology. Good system that was —you see if you say about the qualifications, I disagree. If you said about qualification, how about those millionaires for example Jack Ma. He is not a good — he doesn't have a good education but he has a success business because Yang Berhormat you can't attack me as personal saying that my education is not good. So, I don't have that technology, I don't have that mind. Many businessmen, they have no good education but they have good ideas on business.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *You know that no data but as you say, you were talking about the potential, Jack Ma also right? You just mentioned Jack Ma. Jack Ma had difficulties like convincing people to invest because he didn't have track record. So, your company have track record? So, same thing. Why should one invested RM1.2 million? Jack Ma only got USD50,000 to start with because he couldn't convince anybody. Even though he got big, big ideas. So, you know what I mean or not?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *If you say that he cannot convince, I don't think he will have now that huge business-lah.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *No, with that USD50,000 that he got, he started the business-lah, right? So, right?*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Yang Berhormat Tebrau, rasanya kita fokuskan balik kepada isu ini.

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** Itu balikhlah. Berbalik to issue is...

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Kepada isu kita sekarang ini.

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Why would Wee Jeck Seng want to invest in your company? If not because, like, he has interest in this company and you see him having the position that can help you to make ways, right?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *On how he was willing to invest, I don't know but I told him that what is the potential in the company. If he's interested, he can just join in. This is all, we stated the potential. The company have good ideas. A lot of things that if the thing has been a success, then, why I want —maybe at this amount on why I want them to come in? This is always is their people who were feeling that they want to invest into the company's potential, they just do.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Cuma, saya hendak...*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Okay, last question Tuan Pengerusi.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Okay, all right.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *This is because just now you said for a person to invest into your company must know you well but earlier on you just said neither you know him well or he know you well, right?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I said I know him. I did not say I did not know. I said I know him in year 2010...*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Well.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *...or year 2009. As the time I know him, consider well because in year 2009 or year 2010, I know him as the Deputy Minister.*

■1550

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *So you know him well-lah.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Not you do not know him well.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I know him.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *You know him very well.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I would say I not know what so-called MCA because just now you asked me you know...*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *No, no. I am not talking whether you know or not. So you know him very well lah. That is the question.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes, I know him as a friend, yes.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *As a personal friend lah.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Okey, sebelum saya ini, saya hendak tanya juga, adakah apabila Dato' Sri Wee Jeck Seng, dia meletakkan nama dia sebagai shareholder dia betul-betul ada juga investment dia sendiri ataupun hanya nama sahaja without any injection of money?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No. At that time, when he came in and he did invest and he did inject of the— I would say the money itself.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *How much?*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Berapa?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *The time was RM25,000. The time the company like RM100,000.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *So next question...*

**Seorang Ahli:** *RM25,000?*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Ya, RM25,000. Okay, next question from me. So when Dato' Sri Wee Jeck Seng acquired 25 percent of the shares in your company, he invested RM25,000. What was the value of the company at that time?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *The time the company was...*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *I am talking about value, not paid-up capital.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *The value— then actually if we want to talk about value then you have to go into the whole valuation at that time. So, at the time we did not base on value. We based on the paid-up.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *So, how much would be approximately would be the value of the company? RM500,000? RM1 million? RM10 million?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *The time we based— I said that just now we pay— based on the paid-up. Paid-up at the time was RM100,000.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *So I am asking you what was the value of your company. You own the company. For sure roughly you know the approximate value of your company at that time.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Okay, if you go into value of the company, there are many ways of valuation. Like now in market, you can value the company based on the capitals, you can base the value on the business, revenues. There are many ways to value the company. There is actually there is no a real guideline. So, at that time we just value the company based on paid-up capital.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *So you mean that your company only value at RM100,000 at that time?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *We based— I would say he came in because he followed the proper documents on the paid-up.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *No, that does not necessary mean he has to pay up the RM25,000 to you. Because if you value your company higher, his 25 percent could jump up to RM250,000*



itself, RM25,000 that is my point. So, my point is, did you value your own company in 2014 with a huge potential of getting RM149 million contract at only RM100,000 in 2014?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Okay, at that time, we did not really go into own value the company. To be frank, we did not go and value, we do not have really say oh, what is my value after this. No. We just based on the capital.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** But I think if you are in business for so long, before you sell your 25 percent shares to anyone be it Wee Jeck Seng or some ABC, you will surely be selling it to them at the market value rather than the paid-up capital. Your paid-up capital can be RM2.00 but your company might value at RM1 million.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Value is very difficult to give a guideline what's the value. Many people can value a different amount but then...

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** So if I want to buy your company now, how much would you prefer me to buy?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** If now there is a guideline on based on the revenues, we can follow the revenues.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** That is why you are now telling me that based on revenue but at the time of Wee Jeck Seng acquired to RM25,000, you based it on the paid-up capital. So, I disagree with you on that.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Okay, because at the time we do not have a revenue at that time, so we cannot use a revenue as a guideline. But now there is a revenue, we can use a revenue as a guideline. So, it...

**Tuan Wong Chen:** Can you give your current value today of your company?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** If you want, I have to go through the valuation process.

**Tuan Wong Chen:** Do not have to lah for God's sake. Look, it is just multiply seven times of your PE or whatever for God's sake, we all know this. Two times revenue, three times revenue. What is your valuation today? It is very important. You better tell properly.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** I think this value things you have to get my finance to do because...

**Tuan Wong Chen:** You are the CEO. You cannot not know the value of your company. What are your sales every year? Let me ask you a simple question.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** My sales 20— 20 – 30 million, 20 over million.

**Tuan Wong Chen:** 20 million over sales. How long your concession?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Five years.

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Five years? Okay, how much money you are going to make? What is your profit margin?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Okay. This project that you see is a big amount, 100 over million but there is a CAPEX. There is cost. Okay, so...*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *There is better. You are now thinking through the process. I want your honest opinion. I am not here to do math for you. As a CEO, you should know the value of your company, right? If today I come and I say, "I want to buy 10 percent of your company", you know Kenneth and I are friends lah, say lah, we happened to be friends, you do not know I come from PKR, that is another issue. I want to offer to buy 10 percent of the company. How much will you sell it to me?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *You ask me now, normally— yes, do same people that asking do we want to sell the company. So the same things that we say we have to go into valuation. The process is not that I alone can determine the price. This is a valuation process.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Roughly. I mean— Look, I do not want to quarrel you because it is a long day. Could you just tell me, it is worth RM15 million? Is it worth RM30 million? It is RM10 million? Is it RM2 million? Just roughly, ballpark figure. I am not going to hold it to you.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *You say that what is the value and what is that profits. The profits itself we can't determine until now what is the profit. The outstanding payments from the project itself is we have not being collected for the past two, three years. Even the day one the project been implemented. Major of things not been collected. So, when all these amounts, eaten up our profits, so there is no more actually how can we value. We have no longer value when the company is running slight a negative amount.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *There is a value, the residual value when you sue the government for not paying you what is due to you. Your problem is you did not deliver on time. So the government defer payment. Am I correct?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Not sir.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Then, you deliver everything, the government just do not want to pay you, right? In this case you sue them, there is a residual value how much you can get.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *First thing, we did not sue the government and second thing it's not because of the things did not deliver. If the things did not deliver, I do not think government can collect RM300 over million. We have been delayed, just that the delay comes from many reason like the contract signing delay. All these reasons that impact the delays of the payment.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *I am going to tell you what Wee Jeck Seng to us, okay. He gave the shares back to you.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Yes, sir.

**Tuan Wong Chen:** Okay. So basically, he values your company zero. It is worth nothing to him. This cannot be true. What do you value your own company's worth?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Okay. You see, in my P&L documents, when the business— There is a business but if the business is running loss, the interest that we invested eat up our profit though the company actually is running loss. How he is going to value us when the company is running negative?

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** I can see that you are not telling us the true story...

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** No, I am trying...

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** Anyway, anyway, I just want to see that this company is muchly being controlled by you. You are the founder. You actually now you are holding a share directly or indirectly to IDF? That means you control the company. My question is, Wee Jeck Seng now coming in as a shareholder on invitation or being offered or on what ground?

**Tuan Pengerusi:** That was a very simple question. Sebabnya dia masuk itu sebab dia sendiri hendak masuk ataupun you offer dia masuk ke macam mana. You ajak dia, "Okey mari kita buat syarikat sebab kita hendak pergi masuk tender ini."

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** [Bercakap tanpa menggunakan pembesar suara]

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Itu simple. Itulah simple sangat question itu. I tidak boleh hendak tanya lagi se-simple mana lagi soalan.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Okay, when I know him then after that he was no longer as the government officer. He said any business that can do together, he said he was looking into – see whether what business can he do. So at that time I saw this One Belt One Road business, I said, "We are doing this. If you are interested to invest, you can – we offered him to invest."

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Okey, tetapi soalnya tadi yang ditanya adalah sama ada syarikat ini ataupun Dato' Wee joined syarikat you ini untuk sebelum pergi ke kementerian untuk pergi apply satu projek ini sahajakah ataupun syarikat ini juga digunakan untuk projek-projek lain?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Sebelum dia masuk asalnya kita dah masuk proposal dalam projek ini. So yang dia masuk itu bukan sebab projek VEP/RC ini. Dia masuk sebab the potential of One Belt One Road business that we are going to plan to lah.

■1600

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Akan tetapi adakah Encik Ken tahu bahawa dia adalah Ahli Parlimen daripada MCA? Kalau kita juga maklum bahawa Kementerian Pengangkutan ini juga dikenal

rapat *being associated to* MCA juga ketika itu. Sebab tahu *because you mentioned you* kenal dia masa dia jadi Menteri, lepas itu dia sudah tidak ada lagi memegang jawatan sebagai dalam Kabinet bermaksud dia boleh menjalankan perniagaan.

Bukan kita kata salah, tidak salah sebab dia bukan lagi di dalam *government* tetapi kita hendak tahu bila dia masuk itu sebagai syarikat itu, adakah untuk ada kepentingan sebab hendak menggunakan dia seperti yang tadi Yang Berhormat Jasin maklumkan. Oleh sebab dia- *because you know* dia daripada MCA. You tahu kah tidak dia daripada MCA?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I sudah mentioned...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Mana ada MCA ini. *MCA is a very prominent party* sama juga macam DAP sekarang ini, *[Disampuk] These two*, dulu tidak. *[Ketawa] You know*, kalau dia pegang jawatan sebagai Menteri tidak akanlah you tidak tahu dia *politician*. *That is my question*, senang. Sekejap, sekejap Yang Berhormat Johor Bahru hendak bertanya.

**Tuan Haji Akmal Nasrullah bin Mohd Nasir:** So, jawapan Tuan Pengerusi tadi tidak dijawablah, *hanging*.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Tidak, jawab.

**Tuan Haji Akmal Nasrullah bin Mohd Nasir:** Okey, saya cuma hendak tahu untuk syarikat ini, tadi Encik Tan ada sebut bahawa *Mr. Wee Jeck Seng* masuk untuk tujuan kepentingan membawa projek yang lain. *My first question*, ada dua tiga siri. *My first question*, *revenue* syarikat ini ada sumber *business* yang lain tidak, selain daripada projek ini?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Sepatutnya kita dapat *offer* untuk lain tetapi disebabkan *financial* semasa itu kita *worry to involve in other business*.

**Tuan Haji Akmal Nasrullah bin Mohd Nasir:** Okey, maksudnya sejak Wee Jeck Seng menjadi pemegang saham daripada tahun 2012, 2014...

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Tahun 2014.

**Tuan Haji Akmal Nasrullah bin Mohd Nasir:** ...Sampai 2018, tidak ada *business* baru yang dibawa masuk ke syarikat ini?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Macam *propose* kita buat ada tetapi kita tidak...

**Tuan Haji Akmal Nasrullah bin Mohd Nasir:** Maksudnya tidak ada dapat *revenue*, sumber, hasil daripada lain kecuali daripada projek ini?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Ya.

**Tuan Haji Akmal Nasrullah bin Mohd Nasir:** Okey. Kedua, you cakap tadi *One Belt One Road Initiative* yang mana itu keperluan Dato' Sri Wee untuk dibawa masuk ke syarikat ini. Jadi, *any lead to that* untuk membawa projek itu dan you sebut ada *proposal* yang sudah dihantar semua. *Can you detail a bit, so that we know* hendak membuktikan Dato' Sri Wee Jeck Seng

masuk sini bukannya untuk syarikat ataupun projek ini tetapi ada projek lain? So, projek apa yang...

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Untuk *One Belt One Road* dia *introduced*, dia *introduced* macam dalam *dinner* kah, dia ada *introduced some companies from China*. So, *when we met them together then we tried to discuss about business but at that time, situation is that, we can't move into other business, that is why we on hold, there those few projects*.

**Tuan Haji Akmal Nasrullah bin Mohd Nasir:** Okey, I takkan tanya *detail* syarikat apa semua *but the nature of the business* itu apa?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Trading* dengan IT.

**Tuan Haji Akmal Nasrullah bin Mohd Nasir:** *Trading* dengan IT.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Yes.

**Tuan Haji Akmal Nasrullah bin Mohd Nasir:** Akan tetapi sampai *stage* mana, adakah *lead* itu dapat membuahkan hasil sebab *on that basis* dia empat tahun, lima tahun dia pegang saham tersebut. *Basically*, memang *the only benefit that I can see from here is only this project and so far, it is proven to that way*.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Because for the past three, four years we have many opportunities but we could not move into that opportunity because the project itself we still cannot know when the payment get paid. So the more we invest we cannot— we worried to sustain the company. So, we were trying to stop to – on hold other project first to make more focus on this project*.

**Tuan Haji Akmal Nasrullah bin Mohd Nasir:** So, *on that basis*, maksudnya sepanjang Dato' Sri Wee pegang saham tersebut *the only benefit that* kalau dia dapat sebagai *shareholder* hanyalah melalui projek ini?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *If you come to benefits we did not actually give so-called any benefit to him, just that the time he just held as a shareholder. We hoped that there's a new revenue come in but then we end up we did not focus on the other business*.

**Tuan Haji Akmal Nasrullah bin Mohd Nasir:** *Any dividend being paid out to the shareholders?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** No, no.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** Okey. Mr. Tan ya, balik kepada- *I wish to know more about the shareholding history of your company. Your company was incorporated on the 9th of March 2012, TCSens Sdn Bhd*.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Yes.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** Pada mula-mulanya berapakah *paid-up capital* dia? *When it was incorporated.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I think should be RM100,000.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** RM100,000?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Ya.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *So, you actually transfer RM25,000 share to Wee Jeck Seng in the consideration of RM25,000, betul?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *He bought the one RM25,000.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Okey, next question I think you do not have the documents with you, maybe you write it down. Furnish to the PAC a copy of the transfer form duty stamp.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Okey.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Ya, for the transfer of your 25 percent of share to Wee Jeck Seng. So that is one. Secondly, so I also notice that you have increased your paid-up capital from RM100,000 to RM500,000, five fold?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Yes.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Okey. Of course, the shareholding I think more or less remain the same Dato' Sri Wee Jeck Seng remained having the 25 percent of share, so when you increase your paid-up capital, did you ask him to contribute to the increase of the paid-up capital?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes, I think this is quite common that when you increase the paid-up capital, all shareholders need to be increased. When we told him that we need to increase, so we need that amount of money to increase but he said he had no money to increase at that time. So, I do not have no choice, we still have to increase, so we did the increase and he just like he had to owe us the money-lah.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *So, there will be- so Wee Jeck Seng owes you money?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Ya, yes.

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Okey, next. I leave it to Yang Berhormat Permatang Pauh first.*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** Terima kasih Tuan Pengerusi. Saya ingin bertanya...

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Selepas Yang Berhormat Permatang Pauh nanti selepas itu Yang Berhormat Jasin dulu, okey.

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** Terima kasih Tuan Pengerusi. Saya hendak tanya bagaimanakah Mr. Tan mengenali salah seorang pemilik saham juga iaitu Encik Mizal bin Zaini?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Sorry, come again. I cannot...*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *You do not remember the name?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No, I mean that your question, sorry. Can you ask again?*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *How did you know him? How did he get into the company?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Oh, I know him...*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *Were you playing golf together, or you were watching his concerts, I mean... [Ketawa]*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I think I know him through my friends by the other partner Dato' Roslan because I think his two kids in the same school. If not mistaken lah. I know through him lah.*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *Did you know that Encik Mizal bin Zaini joined UMNO in the year 2011 or you were also not aware which party that was?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Ya, I was not aware actually I was really not aware about that.*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *You guys never spoke about politics.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No.*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *You don't know which party was governing Malaysia then?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Ya, definitely that one I know.*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *Oh, you do.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I know it is under, at the time, during. it was under BN but I do not know he's involved with UMNO because I know he is a celebrity only.*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *Okey, okey. My last question. Now going back to the letter that you submitted, was there any point in time that you remember to your knowledge and your memory that you sent a letter to the Prime Minister of Malaysia.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No.*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *Tidak pernah dihantar surat permohonan kepada Perdana Menteri berkait dengan projek ini? Please try to recall properly before you answer.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *For me, my personal, for me I...*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *On behalf of the company, as in the company's proposal submitted to the Prime Minister of Malaysia and you again at one point was CEO and certainly this has to be within your purview of knowledge. Jadi, adakah tidak setahu Encik Tan yang merupakan Pengarah Eksekutif suatu ketika masa dahulu, ada surat permohonan bagi projek ini dilaksanakan yang dihantar kepada Perdana Menteri Malaysia. It is okay, take your time.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Ya. For me, I can't, I am not – on my sides that my shareholders or directors, I have no idea but for me no. My shareholders or director, I have no idea. I have to check back with them.*

## ■1610

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *So, you are saying— sekejap. He is saying that you never sent personally, but you don't know whether the company has sent?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I mean my other directors or my partners. That one I have no idea.*

**Puan Nurul Izzah binti Anwar:** *So, you don't know sama ada pemilik saham ataupun pengarah lain dalam syarikat telah menghantar surat kepada Yang Amat Berhormat Perdana Menteri. So, by inference mean you don't really know how your company works because how can your company, you know, correspondence with the most powerful man in Malaysia. Company correspondence taking place but you were unaware about it.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *It is because I do have partner also, so sometimes partner who assist to run the business. So, that is why I have to just to refer with him.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Okey. Sebelum itu, sebelum saya serahkan kepada Yang Berhormat Jasin, saya— sebab tahun 2012 itu sebenarnya tidak lama *for a young guy like you*. Dia hanya tujuh tahun sahaja. Tujuh tahun itu tidak lama. *How can you say it is lama*. Mana boleh. Kalau benda yang signifikan, *especially* bawah 30 tahun ketika itu *and then now, you* belum lagi— usia pun belum 40 tahun, *how can you say—* saya tidak boleh hendak terima bila katakan sudah lama, sedangkan satu, *significant event*. Selepas itu yang keduanya pula, *your age, your* kemudahan. *I do not know how to say that, you know*.

Akan tetapi dalam soal jawab kita tadi, kita ada bertanya sama ada kenal siapa yang dihantar— surat itu hantar kepada siapa, *you* tidak boleh hendak menjawab sebab *you* kata sudah lama sangat. Ada sesiapa lain tidak di dalam kementerian itu yang saudara Tan ingat? Contohnya, adakah nama-nama seperti Datuk Ab. Aziz bin Kaprawi *tickle into your mind or you* teringat, "*Oh ya, ada orang lain rupanya yang saya ingat*". Jadinya, saya hendak minta jawapan mengenai perkara ini.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No. I think ya, you said that...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Kenal atau tidak siapa Datuk Ab. Aziz bin Kaprawi?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes, I know he is the Deputy Minister.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Dia parti mana?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I think last time he should be under UMNO, should be.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** UMNO. [Ketawa] Okey, teruskan. Maknanya *you* kenal dengan Datuk Ab. Aziz bin Kaprawi. *You* kenal di mana?



**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I tidak kenal dia, I mean that I know him— you mentioned his name, I know him as a Deputy Minister, but for me to— you said personally know him, no. I just know the name because he is the Deputy Minister. So, I just know he is the Deputy Minister.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Ya kah? Cuma kenal sahaja macam itu?

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** Rentetan...

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Rentetan daripada itu, sila.

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *Your company only RM100,000 paid-up... [Bercakap tanpa menggunakan pembesar suara] 2014. Paid-up capital or what? RM100,000 or RM25,000? [Disampuk] What is your paid-up capital?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Beginning is RM100,000.*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *Okay, RM100,000. You know, for a company of RM100,000 paid-up to go into the proposal of multimillion ringgit, unless you have someone who is influential enough... [Disampuk] Wait, I am saying something. It is because you see, as a businessman, you are always two steps ahead of us unless you have someone who is influential enough. Otherwise, you cannot even go to the door also because you only have RM100,000 paid-up capital, you know. It is a multimillion ringgit project. That means now, you have already taken a very good initiative in getting someone influential enough to secure this one.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Okay. To answer that question, it is not the...[tidak jelas]. The beginning was RM100,000 and been increased in 2014 to RM5 million paid-up.*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *When?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** 2014.

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *Okay. Can I have the documents?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes. In 2014, yes, I can prepare the documents. In 2014, we have been increased to RM5 million paid-up capital.*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *But, the case now... [Bercakap tanpa menggunakan pembesar suara]*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *He came in 2014.*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *[Bercakap tanpa menggunakan pembesar suara]*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Yang Berhormat Jasin, your mic Yang Berhormat Jasin. Your mic.*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *You have done a very good calculation-lah.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Ya Yang Berhormat Jasin. Akan tetapi sebelum Yang Berhormat Jasin nanti, dia tengah bersemangat ke tidak ini?

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *You have done a very good homework, anyway. It is because now, before the thing is being forwarded to the ministry, you increased your paid-up and you need to look someone who is influential enough.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *When the business come into more in details, we found out that the investment and the value of the amounts is huge. When we do the study, then we understand the lane, the system is quite a lot. So, this is where we increased the...*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *Just now I was asking you, when Wee Jeck Seng came into the company, is it on invitation or being offered or his own initiative?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *To your question is when I said when he was no longer being deputy, then he asked whether is it a business can work together. So then, I said yes, there it is. So, this is where the thing come from.*

**Puan Wong Shu Qi:** Yang Berhormat Jasin.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Nanti sekejap. Nanti sekejap. Saya hendak tanya, ramai pula ini. Ramai pula hendak bertanya, *suddenly*. [Disampuk] Baguslah, jadinya untuk kita *build up* kita punya prosiding ini sebab sekarang ini, saya tengok dia macam berpusing-pusing. Ini sebab ramai sangat yang Encik Tan kata tidak kenal...

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** Akan tetapi dia kenal.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Akan tetapi bukti-bukti *otherwise* mengatakan kenal. Saya hendak bertanya sebab saya masih tidak puas hati. Tadi kata *you do not know* Dato' Sri Wee Jeck Seng ini ada dengan MCA, *you* tidak tahu. Itu satulah. Selepas itu, *when I did ask you about* Timbalan Menteri *then, you* cakap tidak kenal tetapi *you* tahu nama ya *because you mentioned that*. Lagi satu saya hendak bertanya juga, kenal tidak dengan Hamidah Osman?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** [Bercakap tanpa menggunakan pembesar suara]

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Turn on your mic.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Hamidah Osman, I...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Cuba jawab sahaja kenal atau tidak.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Maybe from the picture or what, maybe I can try to recall. But, the name itself I can't recognise.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Dato' Hamidah Osman kenal?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Dato' Hamidah Osman?

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Ya. Ini sebab Dato' Hamidah Osman pernah menulis surat atas nama TCSens dan dia mengatakan bahawa dalam surat tersebut, dia adalah Pengerusi TCSens. Macam mana ada pengerusi menulis surat dan bila saya bertanya dengan Encik Tan yang juga merupakan *shareholder* dan juga *the director* dan CEO...

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** CEO tidak tahu.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Tidak tahu pengerusi itu siapa.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *But if you said based on the documents all, we do not have so-called Dato' Hamidah Osman in the company at all.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *So, Dato' Hamidah Osman has never been anyway connected to your company?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes, there is no— actually, she is not the director. She is not a shareholder also.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Okey. Betul ya memang tidak ada. Mengapa dia telah menulis surat kepada Yang Amat Berhormat Perdana Menteri Malaysia ketika itu dan dia tandatangan dia selaku Pengerusi TCSens ini? Kalau sekiranya tadi Encik Tan katakan tidak kenal, tidak tahu dan *not aware of this*, maknanya ini surat palsuah?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Ya.

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** Kena lodge police report.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *If you say...*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** Boleh Chairman?

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Wait, wait. What is his response?*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Okey. Minta respons dahulu.

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** Oh, belum jawab?

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Ini sebab kalau tidak nanti, tidak jawab.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *If you say...*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** Tidak boleh jawab.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *If you say is pengerusi, I think it is very obvious that if you see the company itself, she is not a pengerusi. If there is, I think from SMM, you can see if she is.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Okey, tetapi kenapa ada satu surat yang telah dihantar kepada Yang Amat Berhormat Perdana Menteri Malaysia atas nama TCSens Sdn. Bhd. yang mengatakan bahawa dia *signed* surat itu. Sebelum itu, *signed* Dato' Roslan dia *signed* selaku pengerusi, kemudian —surat kemudiannya Dato' Hamidah Osman ada *signed* juga selaku pengerusi. Macam mana *you as CEO of the company, you* tidak maklum mengenai perkara ini. *Usually* kalau ada orang lain yang mengaku dia pengerusi, *when the pengerusi is someone else – it doesn't make sense to us, you know.*

## ■1620

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Ya, I think you did mention that there is a letter Dato' Roslan who signed, what is that about? Can I have a little bit? Because that letter is not signed by me, so...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Okey, letter ini telah ditujukan kepada Perdana Menteri Malaysia pada 17 Disember 2012. Tajuknya Pembiayaan Inisiatif Swasta (PFI) bagi projek Pengenalpastian Frekuensi Fadio (RFID) bagi pas kenderaan pelawat asing dengan usaha sama Jabatan Pengangkutan Jalan. Bukankah ini topik yang sedang kita bincangkan sekarang? Dan ini tandatangan ini dan letterhead is your letterhead, you know. Macam mana you boleh cakap tidak kenal pengerusi.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Letterhead is my letterhead but sometimes the signing is not me, some letters I cannot 100 percent all go through the letters...*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *We are not saying that you signed the letter...*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *You are not cooperating enough, you are not telling the truth.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No, I tell the truth...*

**Datuk Seri Haji Ahmad bin Haji Hamzah:** *Please cooperate with us. We want you to tell the truth.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *If you said the letter is signed by me, definitely I know but now the letter is not signed by me. How I can know...*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *How come, you know someone can use your letterhead to deal with the, what we call the Prime Minister and you don't know? And then you got the project, then you say the project drop on your lap. But actually, it is through these people and you said you don't know them and you didn't authorise them and you got the project.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Dato' Roslan is one of my partners of the company. I think he only can answer on this. I don't know because the letter is not signed by me.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *No, because ini dia tanggungjawab bersama sebagai satu syarikat. Kalau CEO kah sign is for the company, kalau pengerusi sign pun on behalf of the company. Mana boleh seorang CEO kata, I don't know anything, this is not a letter signed by me. Tidak boleh because dalam structure, although, I understand you are the CEO of the company, tetapi you have the Chairman dan Chairman itu yang tandatangan. That one is basic rule untuk mana-mana syarikat. Kalau pengerusikah, CEO kah tetapi atas letterhead syarikat is syarikat, it is not individual. You cannot say, dekat sini di hadapan kami semua mengatakan it is not signed by me. Mana boleh.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *The time – can I see the position, so the time, more – the signing position, who is the one who is signing the position.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Before that, so Dato' Hamidah Osman has never been your pengerusi?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No..*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *How about Dato' Haji Roslan Ramli? Pun bukan?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No, at that time I think the letter, dia Chairman kah, president?*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Okay, never mind, we are talking about Chairman, pengerusi. So, my question to you, did Dato' Hamidah Osman and Dato' Haji Roslan Ramli ever be your Chairman of your company?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Dato' Roslan yes, but Dato' Hamidah no.*

**Tuan Wong Kah Woh:** *Dato' Hamidah no, Dato' Roslan yes. Okay.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes, that's why the letter is signed by my Chairman, so...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *You said the letter was signed by your Chairman.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Ya, Dato' Roslan is my Chairman.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Okey, maknanya you tahulah itu.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No, because you told me it is signed by Dato' Roslan. So, you told me Dato' Roslan. Dato' Roslan is the Chairman at that time.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Pada tahun 2012, Dato' Roslan is the Chairman.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Yes.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Chairman boleh buat sendirian then kidnap the project just like that?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Not kidnap, he – because I am not – all the times in and out. For this I know only on this business itself, ada business. So, the time Chairman like, asking to operate some of the operations.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *Tuan Pengerusi, doesn't make sense, what you said. How can a CEO and you are a major shareholder and a director, that any person like a chairman can do something without authorisation from the board of directors, without a meeting. You mean there is no board meeting, minuting this?*

*Then, you are not fit to be what you are, what you said, it doesn't fit at all. What you said, you are handling multicompanies, so many companies and you don't even know this. It doesn't – jibe lah.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I handled many businesses but I handle companies a lot that really bring revenue profit. So, who - which those like haven't got a revenue, so I will let back the chairman or who to handle until the real operations come in.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *That means you don't – you just let anybody do anything without even going through the board?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Not anybody. We actually have been appointed him as a Chairman.*

**Tuan Steven Choong Shiau Yoon:** *So, that means, you said not anybody, that means you still want to be in the know, isn't it? How come, what this two Dato' have done and you didn't know what is the content. I say don't make sense, it is not like ordering a newspaper.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Lagi tidak make sense, sorry-lah potong. Lagi tidak make sense, when you said you do not know Aziz Kaprawi because there is the letter sini tahu, minuted to Datuk Aziz Kaprawi as well. You kena cakap betul dengan kita, you know.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *No, I think...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *You are hiding your...*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I am not hiding...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:**...bukannya jalan *behind the bush*, you run around the bush ini. pusing-pusing.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I did not hide anything. The letter I would say, I have said that the letter is not signed by me, it is my Chairman.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Ya, but you know...*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Sorry, let me finish first because the letters have been signed by my Chairman. This question should come from, you should ask from my Chairman itself. You ask me because I...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *No, because Chairman dengan CEO are supposed to be working together, sepatutnya macam itulah. Mana boleh Chairman, okey buat syarikat, pergi buat surat and then bila dapat projek ini Chairman punyalah, it is not yours, it is the chairman's-lah. Macam mana itu?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I come into a full operation when the project has been awarded, I come into full operating. Before this, I think mostly my Chairman is the one who handled quite a lot of things.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Okay, Mr. Tan, let me ask you a simple question. Since you said you have a lot of businesses. Can you tell us your other business because this is a RM140 million to RM160 million project? I would imagine to be your biggest project.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Okey.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Your other business maybe RM10 million, RM5 million, RM20 million but no where near RM140 million unless I am wrong maybe you are a tycoon already, I don't*

know. But is it true that this is your biggest project? And what are your other projects because I want to see, if this is your biggest project, this must be your number one priority.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Okay, first RM150 million that project is not one time, it is a five-year project consist of CAPEX and OPEX. So, equivalence of one year, I think operation is around RM20 million. I highlight back that thing.

Okay, on businesswise, yes, I do have other businesses that have similar revenue also. But you say about this project I aware but this is the thing that after award – before award there is no amount of the...

**Tuan Wong Chen:** No, I understand. I am asking how many projects you got? What other business you got? Right. This one in my opinion could be the biggest one for you. Therefore, you should be paying more attention because now you were just saying that I leave it to my Chairman, I don't care until I get the project, then I look.

If I am aiming for a big project, day and night I will be thinking on that project, normally-lah, unless you are telling me you got another RM500 million project somewhere else which is bigger this one, you better tell us now.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Okay, I did a lot of other projects, not everything get awarded. I have been proposing for construction business to actually also to government, sometimes to the state governments. I did propose the solution to Ministry of Home Affairs. So, all these are those that also big ones. So this is just a proposal...

**Tuan Wong Chen:** How big are they?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Ministry of Home Affairs, I try to active back the 18 million tax which is I think cost also RM100 millions of value, okay.

Then, the – I do construction like millions but not as big as this one. I do, a lot is more into trading business. Trading business which is the revenue a lot but the margin less-lah because I own some business in overseas...

**Tuan Wong Chen:** I understand. So, that's why, in terms of – just be very frank with us. I know you have maybe five, ten projects going on at the same time.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** I trying to...

**Tuan Wong Chen:** I know but this one has to be number one or number two, right, easily-lah.

■1630

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Okay. You see, when the initial this project was started, the value is not as you mentioned over RM100 million. That first proposal was just not that big. Down the road when we do a study, the requirements, the additional scope is only going up to that

*figure. So, when go up to that figure and been awarded, this was where I come in to fully operate this business. From beginning of that, I let my chairman to handle from the beginning side.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *Okeylah. I mean that's your explanation. It's hard for us to believe-lah but it has to be your priority project, isn't it? Is it not the top three, top two project in your— at that time, year 2014. This must be the big one, isn't it? This is your biggest project, isn't it?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *If you said before award, this was not my priority project, to be frank. Because at that time, I don't know which project will move and this project at that time, we also don't know it will move. So, we make more focus— for me, I make more focus on the projects giving revenue. Because I need that projects to— the project is there already. It's making monies. So, I put more focus on the projects that coming for revenue. Coming revenue.*

**Puan Wong Shu Qi [Kluang]:** Tuan Pengerusi, boleh saya tanya?

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Okey, ini tanya soalan kira kepada Encik Tan kira yang terakhir *because* kita tengok bahawa prosiding ini tidak pergi ke mana-mana. Ini kerana dia kata bahawa dokumen tidak adalah, terlupalah, itulah, inilah. Saya akan bagi *last question* kepada Yang Berhormat Kluang...

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** Yang Berhormat Kluang *and then* Yang Berhormat Kota Bharu.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *And* Yang Berhormat Kota Bharu. *Then*, kita *wrap up*. Akan tetapi we *will call you back*.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Okey.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Kali ini jangan cakap terlupa, tidak kenal orang itu, tidak kenal orang ini...

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I think...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *You bring the whole file* semua sekali.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *I have listed that what documents that you needed. I will prepare that those documents-lah.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Okey, Yang Berhormat Kluang. *Then*, Yang Berhormat Kota Bharu.

**Puan Wong Shu Qi:** Terima kasih Tuan Pengerusi. Encik Tan, sini ya. Saya cuma ada satu soalan saja. Ini kerana menurut apa yang kamu kata tadi, nampaknya kamu tidak berminat langsung untuk dapat ataupun tidak berminat, tidak fokus pada projek ini kerana belum dapat lagi. Lebih fokus dengan projek lain yang sudah *generate revenue*. Jadi, boleh saya kata tidak, sebenarnya syarikat kamu dan kamu sendiri tidak berminat untuk dapat projek ini?

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Okey, Yang Berhormat. Bukan tidak minat, kita berminat. Akan tetapi, banyak projek kita *try to enter*. So, kita memang minat tetapi bukan satu saja saya boleh



fokus satu projek. So, masa itu, kita *more*— sebab *this is project that we tried to propose but it doesn't come into revenue yet*. So, we *more focus*— for me *more focus on the revenues that can sustain the company*.

*If I'm just mainly focused on all these many projects, ended up the company can't sustain. It goes nowhere, the company. So, I'm more focused on the things that can bring revenue to the company. I need to sustain that.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Okey, Yang Berhormat Kota Bharu.

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** Okey, Tuan Pengerusi. Mr. Tan ya, soalan saya ada satu, dua dan tiga tetapi *related*. Setuju tidak Kementerian Kewangan telah melantik *your company* TCSens sebagai kontraktor utama pada 27<sup>th</sup> of July 2015? 27<sup>th</sup> of July 2015?

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Tidak ingat bila.

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** 27<sup>th</sup> July 2015?

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** 27<sup>th</sup> July 2015. Ini *you just confirm whether you agree or not?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Sorry?*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *Time to agree. Year 2015.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Are you saying Kementerian Kewangan?*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *Ministry of Finance (MOF) appointed your company to be a main contractor on the 27<sup>th</sup> of July 2015? Do you agree with me?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *MOT or...*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *MOF. This is because the award must be from MOF, not MOT.*

**Tuan Wong Chen:** *MOT help you but MOF be final.*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *Awarded.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Okay, for that I really don't know the process like...*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** Okey, tidak apa. *Before that, do you agree with me, Menteri Pengangkutan (Minister of Transport) telah memohon kepada Yang Amat Berhormat Perdana Menteri untuk melantik your company TCSens secara runding terus? That was on the 10<sup>th</sup> June 2015 and a day later on the 11<sup>th</sup> of June 2015, the Prime Minister agreed to the application by Minister of Transport. Is that within your knowledge or your purview?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *That's not within my knowledge.*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *As the CEO, you do not know that?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Because that one is a process of kementerian. We are just a company, we don't know what is the process of kementerian itself.*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** So, siapa yang tahu? Kalau CEO tidak tahu, adakah *someone else dealing with this project on your behalf or on your company's behalf?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Come back to this project, I did mention that what kementerian been emailed us to do, we just followed. They asked us to do POC, we do. They awarded us, we do. The process itself, I think kementerian only can jawab what is the process.*

**Dato' Takiyuddin bin Hassan:** *Okay.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Okeylah sebab Encik Tan kira...

**Tuan Wong Chen:** Penat, penat.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Penat kita memikirkan... *[Ketawa]* *But yeah, thank you very much for agreeing to come. Akan tetapi ini bukannya— kemungkinan besar kita akan panggil semula bersama semua dokumen yang perlu dibawa oleh Encik Ken lagi dan tidak ada reason mengatakan bahawa sudah lama sangat. No, because every time ada prosiding ini mesti kena tahu berapa lama pun you still have to remember. Were you telling me that when you came tadi, you expect kita hendak bersebang-sembang biasa sajakah apa?*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *Okey, to answer because this PAC— this is the first time I sit into PAC. I don't know...*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** *Everyone pun yang dipanggil PAC pun first time juga. Ini pun ada yang first time juga ini.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *That's why I don't know what procedure, what they will ask. That's what I studied a lot. I recalled back is all the audit reports. I don't know that these are the questions that were going to be asked. If I know early, I would do more studies but I studied the whole documents, all is on the audit. You asked me what problem on the audit, I can answer all but I don't actually have any – questions to know what are you going to ask. So, I did not really study back.*

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Okey, okey. Maka kita tamatkanlah prosiding kita pada hari ni. Saya bagi pihak Ahli-ahli PAC hendak mengucapkan terima kasih kepada Yang Berbahagia Tuan Syed Nasir Syed Ahmad, Timbalan KSU yang sudi untuk bersama-sama dengan kita, bersama-sama dengan pegawai-pegawai lain dan juga Encik Tan kerana hadir bersama di dalam prosiding kita pada petang ini.

Walaupun ia memakan masa dah terlampau lama dah...

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** Tuan Pengerusi, *can I just highlight a bit one more thing that maybe you can take into your consideration, okay. Actually, if you all keep saying that this project did really use so-called your call as direct people to get the project itself. Can I have a bit like — can I explain a bit? If really, we do have so-called such people that you all mentioned that we use*

them to get the project, I think the term being given by the government, not will be better. The whole term giving by the government because this project is something like— it is a new technology and something different. So, the government gives us the term saying that you will not get paid a single cent when the system they're not proven to the government.

I think, if I have those so-called the good politics or you said somebody to get the project, I will not get this term. You see, not most of the projects in government, what I'm from— my understanding. Most government projects in government, you from the beginning, you will get 10 or 15 percent mobilisation. For us, we get a zero-single cent of the government until we prove the system is successfully implemented.

For your information, up to today we are still yet to get fully paid and the operation cost for the past three years, we've not get a single cent. The outstanding— for your information, the outstanding payment for the whole entire project has gone up to RM36 million. I'm actually surviving the RM36 million of the interest. Every year I need to pay.

So, I hope that to— what I did is actually is to protect the effort, the reputation of the country. What we do is we want the country to look good. I can just say, after one year, the payment cannot collect, I just stop the whole business but no. I am still trying to do whatever I can to protect the country's interest. I hope that like Ahli-ahli PAC can look into what efforts we have done for the country.

If we have anything better, I think I can get a better offer not to— if the thing fails, I have to get 100 percent. No. Not a single cent the government need to pay me. I think I hope that you can see what effort been done by us.

**Tuan Wong Chen:** No, no, Mr. Tan. Let's be very clear about this. You signed that contract. Your company has no track record. RM150 million, RM160 million contract can never go to the company like yours. Let's be really clear, okay? It should be a big company with full financing with all those capacities. I don't know how you got this contract, we are not saying that you pull whatever but, on the surface, it's quite clear, there's some political interference. Okay?

Now, you signed on the dotted line, nobody forced you to sign. This is because you thought you can make some money out of this. Because you don't – your track record – if you have done this in Bangladesh or in Pakistan or whatever and you come and tell the government, I have done this before. This is not my first time. Then, the government will give you your 10 percent mobilisation but because you are exceptional circumstances and thank God to some of the civil servants here who actually read the contract, yeah?

To take a chance on you, you have to perform better. That's it. That's the common issue and decision you make. Don't come and complained to us after you got the massive contract that

*this problem is somehow related to your inability to get a better deal just because this allegation of cronyism inside. That's the bottom line brother, you're the businessman. I respect you, ya. I mean look, I will be very frank. I don't care about your background but when you tender a project, generally for the government, we must have certain standards. History, record, everything. Financial capacity, you know? That kind of thing.*

*I'm very sad to hear that you're stuck in this project, believe me. We're not here to criticise you but we do need to know this is an unusual contract. Was there political interference? That's the PAC job because at the surface, it's not good for you. Okay.*

**Encik Tan Chean Suan:** *If you say, on the financial I think what we have proven that the system from the day one never get failed. Even the financial, I think we give a very good reference up to today. Even the government does not pay, we are still sustaining the company to run the operation-lah. I think for that, the things have been proven-lah. Thank you.*

**Encik Mohd Kamal Hisham Abu Bakar:** Tuan Pengerusi, minta maaf sebab pihak syarikat beberapa kali menyatakan bahawa dia tidak dibayar, dia tidak dibayar. Saya hendak membetulkan sedikit kenyataan beliau tersebut.

Untuk makluman Tuan Pengerusi dan juga PAC, kerajaan pada setakat hari ini, kita telah membayar kepada dia RM18.3 juta. Memang betul ada beberapa bayaran yang OPEX yang kita belum bayar kerana keperluan untuk menghormati Peraturan-peraturan Kewangan. Ada yang mereka dan kita perlu penuhi. Juga, CAPEX juga kita tidak bayar lagi dia *20 percent* kerana kita sudah kenakan dia LAD kerana kelewatan dia untuk menyiapkan projek ini pada masanya.

So, saya harap sebab— kerana percakapan hari ini kena— akan direkodkan. So, kita— *we have to put it on record* dan bukan kita saja-saja tidak hendak bayar dia. Akan tetapi kerana dia ada— contohnya LAD yang kita kenakan pada dia *20 percent out of the CAPEX* itu kerana dia tidak— syarikat tidak memenuhi keperluan kontrak untuk menyiapkan kontrak ini pada masanya.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Okey, jadinya yang *double counting* yang sebelum penemuan audit itu kan ada juga itu. Itu adakah syarikat akan membayar semulakah macam mana?

**Encik Mohd Kamal Hisham Abu Bakar:** Kita tidak bayar, tidak pernah bayar. Itu yang saya maksudkan tadi, Tuan Pengerusi. Apabila kita jumpa teguran-teguran audit tersebut kita tahan beberapa bayaran yang tidak perlu bayar. Kita tidak bayar. So, memang ada invoice lebih kurang RM18 juta yang sudah dikemukakan untuk tahun 2016— *No, no.*

**Encik Megat Farizul Ikhwan Megat Khushari:** *Year 2016 to year 2018.*

**Encik Mohd Kamal Hisham Abu Bakar:** *Year 2016 to year 2018* yang termasuk juga elemen-elemen yang ada *double counting* ini, kita tengah *verify* balik sebab kita tidak hendak

*double counting*. Seperti mana yang dimaklumkan sebentar tadi, mana yang *double counting* itu, kita akan keluarkan dan kita akan buat *supplemental contract*. Terima kasih Tuan Pengerusi.

**Tuan Pengerusi:** Okey, terima kasih banyak-banyak kepada Tuan Syed Nasir dan semua yang hadir pada hari ini di hadapan PAC Parlimen Malaysia. *Thank you very much*.

***[Mesyuarat ditangguhkan pada jam 4.43 petang]***